

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
1.0 General Technical Submission				
1.1 Project Management Plan (maximum of 30 pages, excluding curriculum vitae)				
1.1.1	General Approach – Project Management Plan	15	89%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Past partnerships with the City, and past experience working at the Airport. Provided several examples that demonstrate relevant experience. Emphasis on public and worker safety. Proposing a strong team of key individuals, with rail experience and previous experience in Stage 1 (WSP – lead designer for Stage 1 and Tomlinson). Early use of the M&R team is clearly identified and structured. Proposing experienced Colas staff. Tomlinson and Colas have self-performing ability. Good understanding of the project. Covered all aspects that were asked for in detail. Intend to contract Rail Term for rail traffic control during shutdown.</p> <p>Negative attributes: Some of the key individuals do not meet the years of experience requirements and/or the previous experience on projects of similar nature: The Environmental Manager only has 8 years' experience (15 years required). The Safety and Security Manager only has 10 years' experience (15 years required).</p> <p>Consensus: 89% (revised)</p>

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
1.2	Integrated Management System (maximum of 30 pages)	20	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: The training program, including preventive actions, is well structure, with full philosophy of training defined for all workers. Provides a good definition of communication strategy and lines of communication. The decision making process includes lessons learned. Management Team is involved in the IMS approach. IMS Director has performed this role and implemented this system in a previous rail project.</p> <p>Negative attributes: Station Communications equipment should be grouped in with the station design: currently shown as two separate design packages.</p> <p>Consensus: 85% (revised)</p>
1.3	Environmental Management Plan (maximum of 20 pages, excluding (1)(I))	15	82%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Good understanding of project-specific contamination issues tied to the risk assessment. Demonstrated familiarity with Environmental Reports and local conditions and provided specific list of areas with high potential for contamination. Proposal suggests specific sensitive receivers (MSF, Dow's Lake and Walkley Station). Provide specific measures at VIA grade separation and Hunt Club to limit Leda clay excavation.</p> <p>Negative attributes: No mention to past experience with permitting. Limited detail on mitigation strategies for noise and vibration, during the Design stage.</p>

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
				Consensus: 82% (validated)
1.4	Construction Communications and Stakeholder Engagement (maximum of 10 pages)	5	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Good example of partners working together in past projects and lessons learned (specifically Bank Street reconstruction project). Good examples of community involvement and crisis communication. Key Individual has good past experience.</p> <p>Negative attributes: Limited project-specific ideas in respect to the Communications Strategy.</p> <p>Consensus: 85% (validated)</p>
1.5	Works Schedule PBS-1 (maximum of 10 pages excluding PBS-1)	30	83%	
				<p>Positive attributes: The schedule has a good critical path, reflects PA constraints, and addresses all the criterion that allow monitoring of the schedule. Schedule control techniques and tracking/reporting methods are very good. Defines a clear risk mitigation strategy. Provides a clear definition of the engagement timing of the M&R Manager. Provides very good explanation of Airport and NRC constraints.</p> <p>Negative attributes:N/A</p> <p>Consensus: 83% (validated)</p>

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
1.6	Risk Management Plan (maximum of 10 pages – excluding Risk Register)	5	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Preliminary risk assessment demonstrates a good understanding of the key project risks, includes good categorization of the risks, and draws on previous project experience. Good summary of project constraints. Very good proposed risk mitigations including use of self-supplied material resulting in better control of the supply chain. Provided a contingency plan.</p> <p>Negative attributes: N/A</p> <p>Consensus: 85% (validated)</p>
1.7	Systems Integration Management Plan (SIMP) (maximum of 30 pages)	15	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Addressed all aspects required under a high level description while providing an overall good level of detail, including a detailed listing of tests with City participation. Provided a good conflict resolution process and a very good ICD matrix (thorough and detailed).</p> <p>Negative attributes: Incorrectly states that core switches and RTU switches are issued by the City.</p> <p>Consensus: 85% (validated)</p>
1.8	Early Works Agreement	NOT SCORED		

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

	Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes

	Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
2.0 DESIGN SUBMISSION			
2.1	Civil and Guideway Design Submission (maximum of 50 pages)	25	85%
			<p>Positive attributes: Very good quality of the design package overall. Clear and detailed drawings that articulate premium project solutions. Includes exceedances that provide value to the City:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Rideau River Bridge is designed as a full replacement with a Level 1 aesthetics and the design addresses conflicts with the MUP. - Lester Rail bridge is designed for freight loading and gradient, and therefore eliminates the requirement for an at grade crossing. - Bowesville cross-over and Limebank storage track have been provided, although these are not required by PSOS. <p>Negative attributes: Brookfield siding is non-conformant and may impact the design for the VIA grade separation (Ellwood), as well as operational impacts (results in a pinch point due to a shorter siding). NRC spur connection as designed will require rework in the NRC Yard (TE-NC002: NRC Yard).</p> <p>Consensus: 85% (validated)</p>
2.2	Utilities, Geotechnical, Drainage and Stormwater Management, Urban Design	25	82%

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
	and Landscape Architecture (maximum of 45 pages)			
				<p>Positive attributes: Clear and comprehensive Urban Design and Landscaping package, demonstrating detailed MUP design, and snow storage areas. Geotechnical package shows very detailed project-specific understanding of geo and hydro geo conditions with a clear plan forward. Utilities Design demonstrates good understanding of the TC EC-10 and municipal requirements, and provides a detailed breakdown of utility types. Offered pre and post construction CCTV. Provides specific detail regarding water works at Leitrim and Airport.</p> <p>Negative attributes: No specific design criteria described for the Stormwater Management design, i.e. only cursory descriptions and limited detail on how the stormwater will be managed. Limited detail on Public Art.</p> <p>Consensus: 82% (validated)</p>
2.3	Systems Design Submission (maximum of 40 pages)	25	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Signalling design is robust and well described, providing a full detailed narrative on all the functionalities and features of the signalling system, and allows for a backup solution for freight rail. Integration is flagged as risk issue, and there is a defined plan to mitigate. Interface management is addressed comprehensively.</p> <p>Negative attributes:</p>

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
				N/A Consensus: 85% (validated)
2.4	Station Design Submission (maximum of 40 pages)	30	69%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Good design provided for Carling station. Overall good level of mechanical and electrical design.</p> <p>Negative attributes: Design of Uplands, Bowesville and Leitrim ramps is non-conformant with passenger flow requirements in PSOS Schedule 15-2 Part 4 Section 1.2 (f). This was raised as a non-conformance in the Conformance Report. The lack of weather protection across all stations is non-conformant with PSOS, Schedule 15-2 Part 4 Clause 2.5,(b)(i)B, and Clause 2.5,(b)(iii)B. This was raised as a non-conformance and a Conformance Event in the Conformance Report (TE-NC005: Station Weather Protection, Roofing).</p> <p>Consensus: 69% (validated)</p>
2.5	New Walkley Yard Design Submission (maximum of 30 pages)	20	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Overall quality of design package is good and provides comprehensive detail. Very good yard layout and front entrance arrangement. The design includes a good target for LEED certification (6-point buffer).</p>

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
				<p>Mechanical and electrical details are comprehensive and the facility functions are well coordinated and consolidated.</p> <p>Negative attributes: Redundant track access to mainline is unobservable.</p> <p>Consensus: 85% (validated)</p>
2.6	Vehicle Fleet Design Submission (maximum of 30 pages)	20	80%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Demonstrates very good understanding of the required work and has very good project experience in similar scope of work (First Group has proven relevant past experience in overall integration of vehicle on-board systems). Provided a detailed list of planned modifications to the existing vehicle fleet. The use of system engineering processes to manage the work provides confidence in the ability to execute the work.</p> <p>Negative attributes: Limited detail on how to address the differing vehicle platform heights for the mixed vehicle fleet.</p> <p>Consensus: 80% (validated)</p>
2.7	Airport Link (No limit)	NOT SCORED		
2.8	System Safety and Security Certification (Maximum Pages 15)	10	80%	

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
				<p>Positive attributes: Good description of the program, describing processes requiring approval and sign-off. Safety described as a significant priority, with strong key individuals proposed on the team.</p> <p>Negative attributes: Narrative could have been further enhanced with project-specific details.</p> <p>Consensus: 80% (validated)</p>
2.9	Dow's Lake Tunnel Design Submission (maximum of 10 pages)	10	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Design package is well developed. Provides a detail plan to rehabilitate the expansion joints and crack sealing, and replacement of pumps and heat tracing. Provision for four new reversible axial fans for TVS. Proposes to demolish and replace sections of the base slab as required. Substantial expansion to pump house to accommodate new fans.</p> <p>Negative attributes: N/A Consensus: 85% (validated)</p>

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
3.0 CONSTRUCTION SUBMISSION				
3.1	Emergency Response Plan (maximum of 20 pages)	10	90%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Very good response with detail regarding personnel and activities, and acknowledging project-specific high risk areas. Includes a comprehensive risk register. Describes specific emergency response actions at the Airport. All incidents are reported to the City of Ottawa. Includes job hazard analysis.</p> <p>Negative attributes: N/A</p> <p>Consensus: 90% (validated)</p>
3.2	Traffic and Transit Management Plan and Construction Access Management Plan (maximum of 40 pages)	25	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Very good project specific information with good visual support detailing the traffic management activities. Describes mitigation of construction impact on traffic. Lists construction accesses for each site along with foreseen impacts and proposed mitigation.</p> <p>Negative attributes: Lack of detail on the daily monitoring requirements. No information regarding community impacts. No haul routes identified. The statement “no impact to transit” is not substantiated and is limited to the lane closures.</p>

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
				Consensus: 85% (validated)
3.3	Construction Plan (maximum of 40 pages, excludes staging drawings)	40	98%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Very good understanding of project scope; demonstrated ability and resources to deliver the project. Very good description of the strategies proposed for managing construction adjacent to active rail lines. Good staging solutions developed to avoid issues related to utility conflicts and traffic impact. Propose a Ground Disturbance Permit Program, which defines an internal process for approval of excavation activities. Includes a list of secondary impacts and related mitigation tasks. Tomlinson’s ability to self-supply relevant materials such as concrete, asphalt and aggregate provides more confidence in the project delivery. Proposes to split supply and install contracts which allows more control. Includes a girder erection plan at the Airport. Includes a commitment to high quality design used for tendering. The team retains a large existing reserve of labour and equipment. Commitment to addressing constructability issues early in the design development. Narrative acknowledges the required coordination with Capital Rail. Provides good detail on Ellwood and CN diamonds working with VIA. The Technical Director and Construction Manager have worked together in past projects.</p> <p>Negative attributes: N/A</p> <p>Consensus: 98% (revised)</p>

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
3.4	System Testing and Commissioning Plan (maximum of 25 pages)	25	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Good section by section delineation of City and Project Co responsibilities, and good understanding of the trial running activities. Demonstrated good understanding of steps required to achieve Substantial Completion, and provided a logic diagram/flow chart detailing the path to substantial completion through the Independent Certifier. Provided a breakdown and further detail of the various tests. T&C coordinator is identified from Financial Close. Propose a software tool for tracking minor deficiencies. Detailed consideration of performance factors (passengers, operations, weather), and a good understanding of timing requirements.</p> <p>Negative attributes: N/A</p> <p>Consensus: 85% (validated)</p>
3.5	Health and Safety Certification (no page limit)	NOT SCORED		
3.6	Mobility Matters Lanes (maximum of 5 pages)	5	80%	

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
				<p>Positive attributes: Strong detailed narrative describing location by location of road closures, broken down by road section and closure timing. Hours included in the Target Letter (to quantify an amount).</p> <p>Negative attributes: N/A</p> <p>Consensus: 80% (validated)</p>

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
4.0	MAINTENANCE AND REHABILITATION SUBMISSION			
4.1	Maintenance & Rehabilitation Approach to Part 1 of Schedule 15-3 of the Project Agreement (maximum of 30 pages)	40	89%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Strong key individuals proposed, with direct experience in similar projects. Several (6) senior level maintenance staff assigned to the project from the commencement date. Direct experience on rail wayside infrastructure and vehicle systems. Applying strategies and techniques of previous projects to project-specific situations and challenges, including work safety programs. Describes a process that considers the M&R team's interpretation of the performance specifications, and contribution to the design, ensuring key elements are considered to achieve the required performance metrics. Addresses the importance of transferring the existing system infrastructure after Financial Close. Clear strategy for taking over and maintaining the VIA diamond.</p>

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
				<p>Negative attributes: N/A</p> <p>Consensus: 89% (validated)</p>
4.2	Maintenance & Rehabilitation Approach to Appendix A (Maintenance Performance Requirements) to Schedule 15-3 of the Project Agreement (maximum of 30 pages)	40	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Maintenance company is providing a Facility Management Guide which will include input to the design and construction, from the start of the project. Provides a list of Transport Canada regulatory filings, demonstrating an understanding of the standards that need to be met, and setting a baseline for how a specific part of the track should be kept in service. Detailed breakdown of mobilization for the different phases, including the shutdown period.</p> <p>Negative attributes: Limited detail regarding the interface with authorities (CN, Airport, NRC and fare collection).</p> <p>Consensus: 85% (revised)</p>
4.3	Maintenance & Rehabilitation Approach to Appendix B (Asset Preservation) to Schedule 15-3 of the Project Agreement (maximum of 25 pages (excluding lifecycle work schedule))	35	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Use of the Shutdown Period to undertake improvements to the LINT fleet to ensure reliability of the fleet.</p>

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
				<p>Built in Capital Rail’s Inspection and Safety rules into the CMMS, as well as Stadler and LINT maintenance plans. Good examples provided for decision making prioritization on the condition of assets, e.g.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Thermal imaging - Benchmarking - Magnetoscopes - Updating Preventative Maintenance Plans to increase performance - Failure analysis and root cause analysis <p>Using FRACAS to look at how obsolescence will affect the fleet. Condition reports to expand or extend the balance of life of components or subsystems. Acknowledgement of Capital Rail’s Bridge safety management plan and BCI ratings.</p> <p>Negative attributes: N/A</p> <p>Consensus: 85% (validated)</p>
4.4	Maintenance & Rehabilitation: Approach to Appendix C (Expiry Date Requirements) to Schedule 15-3 and Schedule 23 – Expiry Transition Procedure of the Project Agreement (maximum of 5 pages)	10	85%	
				<p>Positive attributes: Detailed org chart and flow chart indicating team’s understanding of the required positions at the end of the maintenance and rehabilitation period, to support handover. Good list of supporting information to be given to the City at handover. Good understanding of Appendix C of Schedule 15-2 and PA Schedule 23.</p> <p>Negative attributes: N/A</p>

TRILLIUM LINE EXTENSION PROJECT
TECHNICAL EVALUATION | CONSENSUS WORKSHEET

PROPONENT:	TEA	FINAL GRADE:	84.03%	REVISED/VALIDATED GRADE:	84.91%
DATE:	Start: 26 September 2018, 10:15am End: 26 September 2018, 4:05pm	FINAL SCORE:	420.15	REVISED/VALIDATED SCORE	424.55

		Maximum Points	Consensus Grade	Positive and Negative attributes
				Consensus: 85% (validated)