



Office of the Auditor General / Bureau du vérificateur général

FOLLOW-UP TO THE 2006 AUDIT OF THE

OTTAWA FIRE SERVICES BRANCH

2009

SUIVI DE LA VÉRIFICATION DE LA DIRECTION

DU SERVICE DES INCENDIES D'OTTAWA DE 2006

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	i
RÉSUMÉ.....	v
1 INTRODUCTION	9
2 KEY FINDINGS OF THE ORIGINAL 2006 AUDIT OF THE OTTAWA FIRE SERVICES BRANCH.....	9
3 STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF 2006 AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS .	11
4 SUMMARY OF THE LEVEL OF COMPLETION	33
5 CONCLUSION.....	34
6 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT.....	35

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

The Follow-up to the 2006 Audit of the Ottawa Fire Services Branch was included in the Auditor General's 2009 Audit Plan.

The key findings of the original 2006 audit included:

- Effective management of the Ottawa Fire Services (OFS) Branch is seriously impeded by the provisions of its current collective agreement;
- There is a need to establish a regulatory by-law for Council to clearly define the characteristics of Fire Service including response standards;
- The on-going station location study should identify opportunities for greater efficiencies that have yet to be realized as a result of municipal amalgamation;
- The current management structure, which has only a small number of non-unionized positions responsible for over 900 employees, is not workable;
- Staffing on the basis of merit rather than simply length of service is not possible;
- Management-led debriefings of fire incidents are not occurring; and,
- Fire investigations and property safety inspections should be improved by training and utilizing fire fighters in these areas.

Summary of the Level of Completion

The table below outlines our assessment of the level of completion of each recommendation as of Fall 2009.

CATEGORY	% COMPLETE	RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL RECOMMENDATIONS
LITTLE OR NO ACTION	0 – 24	9, 13, 15 ¹ , 16, 19b	5	22%
ACTION INITIATED	25 – 49	18c, 19a, 20	3	13%
PARTIALLY COMPLETE	50 – 74	4, 8, 11, 14	4	17%
SUBSTANTIALLY COMPLETE	75 – 99	17	1	4%
COMPLETE	100	1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 10, 12, 18a, 18b	10	44%
TOTAL			23	100%

¹ Management disagreed with recommendation 15 related to possible organizational changes. Management has chosen to focus on Recommendation 14 as the preferred option to address the common audit objective of enhanced OFS management resources/capacity and leadership. As such, Recommendation 15 has not been implemented.

Conclusion

The highlights of Management's "fully implemented" accomplishments pertaining to the audit recommendations include the following:

- Although Council approval was obtained two years later than originally anticipated, results based, measurable service delivery outcomes have been formalized in a new Establishing and Regulatory By-law, thereby adding long term stability to OFS financial, operational and service level planning.
- A risk management based service planning application (GIS enabled) has been designed and successfully implemented. Undertaken in cooperation with the Ontario Fire Marshal, this application models station location options and supports intelligent growth related service planning. It also supports station specific response time measurement and performance target setting.
- A new performance measurement framework has been designed using design inputs from Ontario Municipal Benchmarking Initiative (OMBI) and the Fire Marshal's performance measurement project. Reporting to City Council with a comprehensive set of indicators, accomplishment and targets will proceed in September 2009.
- An Integrated Records Management System has been designed and implemented to consolidate numerous operational data sets concerning core suppression, rescue, inspection, public education, investigation and training activities.
- The "Wake Up" smoke alarm program has been delivered using already deployed "in service" staff. Since inception, the program has cut non-compliant smoke alarm inspection results by half. Since program inception Ottawa has experienced a significant reduction in annual fire fatality rates.
- Management capacity will be strengthened by the "no net cost" introduction of Assistant Deputy Chief positions. These positions will foster accountability, leadership and an enhanced results based culture across the OFS.
- A multi-layered fire incident de-briefing tool has been designed and implemented to ensure appropriate follow-up by appropriate levels of management (depending on the severity of the incident).

In addition to the above noted recommendations, the OFS has also made measurable progress on audit inspired initiatives such as strategic planning, integrated communications across the Emergency and Protective Services department, and false alarm risk mitigation. However, implementation of an automated rostering system remains well behind schedule.

Now that City-wide restructuring has largely proceeded, accelerated OFS progress on remaining audit recommendations should be possible. At the time of the follow-up audit, revised critical path information on outstanding audit recommendations were expected to be supplied/confirmed during Q3 2009.

A number of recommendations remain outstanding as follows:

- Placing investigators on shifts versus the current use of on-call and overtime remains a collective bargaining issue (recommendation 9);
- A long-range plan for the OFS remains a work-in progress (recommendation 13);
- Provision of adequate Labour Relations support to OFS remains unresolved (recommendation 16); and,
- Implementation of the automated rostering system remains outstanding and no critical path has been established for its completion (recommendation 19).

Acknowledgement

We wish to express our appreciation for the cooperation and assistance afforded the audit team by management.

RÉSUMÉ

Introduction

Le Suivi de la vérification du service des incendies d'Ottawa de 2006 était prévu dans le Plan de vérification du Bureau du vérificateur général de 2009.

Les constatations principales de la vérification de 2006 sont les suivantes :

- les dispositions de sa convention collective actuelle constituent un sérieux obstacle à la gestion efficace du Service des incendies d'Ottawa (SIO);
- il est nécessaire, pour le Conseil municipal, de créer une loi de nature réglementaire visant à établir clairement les caractéristiques du Service des incendies, notamment des normes d'intervention;
- l'étude en cours sur l'emplacement des casernes devrait permettre de déterminer des façons de réaliser de plus grandes économies, économies qui n'ont toujours pas été réalisées depuis la fusion;
- la structure administrative actuelle, qui ne compte qu'un petit nombre d'employés non syndiqués responsables de plus de 900 employés, ne permet tout simplement aucune marge de manœuvre;
- il est impossible de recruter du personnel en fonction du mérite plutôt qu'uniquement en fonction de l'ancienneté;
- l'administration ne procède actuellement à aucune séance de compte-rendu ou de retour en arrière à la suite d'un incendie; et,
- les enquêtes sur des incendies et les inspections de sécurité des immeubles devraient être améliorées par la formation et l'utilisation de pompiers pour ces deux tâches.

Sommaire du degré d'achèvement

Le tableau ci-dessous présente notre évaluation du degré d'achèvement de chaque recommandation à l'automne 2009 :

CATÉGORIE	POURCENTAGE COMPLÉTÉ	RECOMMANDATIONS	NOMBRE DE RECOMMANDATIONS	POURCENTAGE DU TOTAL DES RECOMMANDATIONS
PEU OU PAS DE MESURES PRISES	0 – 24	9, 13, 15 ¹ , 16, 19b	5	22 %
MESURE AMORCÉE	25 – 49	18c, 19a, 20	3	13 %
COMPLÉTÉE EN PARTIE	50 – 74	4, 8, 11, 14	4	17 %
PRATIQUEMENT COMPLÉTÉE	75 – 99	17	1	4 %
COMPLÉTÉE	100	1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 10, 12, 18a, 18b	10	44 %
TOTAL			23	100 %

Conclusion

Les grandes lignes du travail réalisé pour une « pleine mise en œuvre » des recommandations du vérificateur par la direction attestent entre autres que :

- même si l'approbation du Conseil municipal a été obtenue deux ans plus tard que prévu, des attentes mesurables et fondées sur les résultats en matière de prestation de services ont été précisées dans une nouvelle loi sur l'établissement de réglementation, qui a permis d'ajouter une stabilité à long terme à la planification financière, opérationnelle et sur les niveaux de service du SIO;
- une application de planification des services fondée sur la gestion des risques (adapté à SIG) a été conçue et déployée avec succès. Conçue en collaboration avec le Commissaire des incendies de l'Ontario, cette application modélise les possibilités d'emplacement des casernes et adopte une approche de planification des services fondée sur la croissance. L'application permet également de mesurer les délais d'intervention par caserne et de fixer des cibles de rendement;
- un nouveau mécanisme de mesure du rendement a été conçu en tenant compte des observations de l'Initiative d'analyse comparative des services municipaux de l'Ontario (IACSM) et du projet de mesure du rendement du Commissaire des incendies de l'Ontario. Un compte rendu de l'ensemble complet d'indicateurs, de réalisations et de cibles sera soumis au Conseil municipal en septembre 2009;

¹ La direction était en désaccord avec la recommandation 15, qui proposait des changements dans sa structure de gestion. La direction a plutôt choisi de privilégier la recommandation 14 comme solution à l'objectif de vérification commun pour une meilleure gestion des ressources, des capacités et du leadership du SIO. Pour cette raison, la recommandation 15 n'a jamais été mise en pratique.

- un système intégré de gestion des dossiers a été créé et mis en œuvre dans le but de regrouper les nombreux ensembles de données opérationnelles relatifs aux opérations de base de lutte contre les incendies, au sauvetage, à l'inspection, à l'éducation du public, aux enquêtes et aux activités de formation;
- le programme *Réveillez-vous* pour les détecteurs de fumée a été réalisé en ayant recours à du personnel déjà en service; depuis sa mise en place, il a permis de réduire de moitié le nombre d'inspections de détecteurs de fumée non conformes, et a également réduit considérablement le nombre annuel de décès dans des incendies;
- la capacité de gestion sera renforcée par la mise en place de postes de sous-chef adjoint « à coûts nets nuls »; ces postes favoriseront la responsabilisation, le leadership et une culture plus axée sur les résultats à l'échelle du SIO;
- un outil de débrefage à paliers multiples a été conçu et déployé afin d'assurer les suivis nécessaires par les niveaux hiérarchiques appropriés (selon la gravité des incidents).

En plus des recommandations relevées ci-dessus, le SIO a accompli des progrès tangibles sur le plan des diverses initiatives inspirées par la vérification, notamment en ce qui a trait à la planification stratégique, aux communications intégrées à l'échelle des Services de protection et d'urgence et à la réduction des risques de fausse alerte. Toutefois, la mise en place d'un système automatisé de préparation des horaires connaît des retards considérables sur l'échéancier prévu.

Puisque la restructuration à l'échelle de toute la Ville est maintenant largement terminée, une accélération de la progression du SIO sur les recommandations restantes du vérificateur devrait être possible. Lors de la vérification de suivi, des renseignements sur l'échéancier révisé des recommandations encore en suspens étaient attendus ou à confirmer au cours du troisième trimestre de 2009.

Un certain nombre de recommandations demeurent encore en suspens, notamment :

- la mise en place de quarts de travail pour les enquêteurs au lieu du recours aux heures supplémentaires ou au travail sur appel, qui demeure un problème de négociations dans le cadre de leur convention collective (recommandation 9);
- le plan à long terme du SIO, qui est toujours en cours de préparation (recommandation 13);
- l'affectation de spécialistes en relations de travail nécessaires au SIO est un problème encore non résolu (recommandation 16); et,

- la mise en place d'un système automatisé pour les horaires de travail n'a toujours pas été effectuée et aucun échéancier n'a été précisé pour un éventuel déploiement (recommandation 19).

Remerciements

Nous tenons à remercier la direction pour la coopération et l'assistance accordées à l'équipe de vérification.

1 INTRODUCTION

The Follow-up to the 2006 Audit of the Ottawa Fire Services Branch was included in the Auditor General's 2009 Audit Plan.

The key findings of the original 2006 audit included:

- Effective management of the Ottawa Fire Services Branch is seriously impeded by the provisions of its current collective agreement;
- There is a need to establish a regulatory by-law for Council to clearly define the characteristics of Fire Service including response standards;
- The on-going station location study should identify opportunities for greater efficiencies that have yet to be realized as a result of municipal amalgamation;
- The current management structure, which has only a small number of non-unionized positions responsible for over 900 employees, is not workable;
- Staffing on the basis of merit rather than simply length of service is not possible;
- Management-led debriefings of fire incidents are not occurring; and,
- Fire investigations and property safety inspections should be improved by training and utilizing fire fighters in these areas.

2 KEY FINDINGS OF THE ORIGINAL 2006 AUDIT OF THE OTTAWA FIRE SERVICES BRANCH

1. The audit of the management control framework of the Ottawa Fire Services identified a number of strengths within the Branch, including:
 - The OFS has made good progress developing a more effective fire service since amalgamation including ensuring standardized training requirements and consistent operating procedures.
 - Interrelationships with other related City functions have improved and are in most cases strong.
 - The OFS has a strong recruitment and training program in place with typically several hundred prospective recruits awaiting entry-level positions.
 - The recently implemented attendance management program has made progress in reducing chronic absenteeism.
 - Good progress has been made in implementing a new management information system designed to support fire services.
 - The OFS is currently at work on a comprehensive fire risk assessment of the entire City including a station location study to guide revisions to the service delivery model.

- The OFS is at work pursuing improvements in its procurement practices to standardize equipment, streamline purchasing practices, build data bases on existing inventories and implement standing offers.
2. The current legislative and regulatory framework implies a much greater burden on municipal councils to clearly articulate its expectations and provide for its own oversight of the fire service. Many city councils have done so via the creation of an “establishing and regulatory by-law” which identifies the specific characteristics of the fire service including response times, level of public education, frequencies of fire inspections, etc. The City of Ottawa currently does not have such a by-law.
 3. Currently there is no formal mechanism at the City for Council to receive regular detailed information on the activities of the OFS.
 4. The risk assessment and station location currently underway in the OFS should be broad enough to investigate opportunities for increased efficiency and savings that may have arisen as a result of eliminating boundaries that existed prior to amalgamation. In addition, once such a risk assessment is completed, the OFS should establish a process to regularly re-assess fire risk in our community.
 5. In developing an enhanced property inspection and fire investigation program, the OFS should be pursuing the use of fire fighting resources in this area.
 6. Management should implement formal management led post-incident debriefings, participation should be mandatory and operational issues and recommended changes for the future should be documented. A standard format for these debriefings should be developed to better ensure that all substantive issues are reviewed and discussed on a consistent basis and that recommendations arising from these sessions are brought forward for decision-making.
 7. Strategic planning and risk assessment for the City’s fire services should examine the overall role of the Fire Service for the future. The concepts of a regulatory by-law, conducting risk assessments and examining the overall role and programs provided by the fire service leads to the notion of a consolidated long-range strategic plan. The current risk assessment and station location initiative now underway in OFS represents a key first step in this exercise.
 8. The current management structure and many of the existing collective agreement provisions place significant barriers to ensuring an effective management control framework is in place within the OFS. The minimal number of management positions, a culture that discourages effective communication between unionized staff and managers and a promotional process that effectively prevents selecting candidates on the basis of merit has had significant implications on ensuring effective delegation of authority, staff

supervision and oversight, assignment of resources, succession planning and performance monitoring.

3 STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF 2006 AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

2006 Recommendation 1

That the existing regulatory by-law for fire services, carried over from the former City of Ottawa, be repealed and that the Ottawa Fire Services develop a new Establishing and Regulatory By-law for Council approval which clearly articulates all key objectives and features of the fire service.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation and will bring forward a By-law in October 2007.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 1 at December 31, 2008

A draft by-law has been prepared for review by Corporate Law. A Committee and Council report is scheduled to come forward in Q1/Q2 2009.

Management: % complete *50%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 1

At the time of the follow-up the draft Regulatory By-law was obtained and reviewed. The By-law received Council approval in September 2009. Therefore, although approval was received two years later than projected by management in its original response, the recommendation is now fully implemented.

OAG: % complete *100%*

2006 Recommendation 2

That the Ottawa Fire Services develop by-laws for Council approval governing each of the existing cross-boundary agreements with neighbouring municipalities.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Currently there is a mutual aid agreement in place with the Town of Kemptville that was in effect prior to amalgamation. There are also informal arrangements for mutual aid with the municipalities of Clarence-Rockland, Russell, North Dundas and Lanark. Fire Services also purchases fire suppression services annually from the municipalities of Merrickville and Arnprior for those portions of the City that

are closer to these centres. While a standard agreement is recommended to formalize these mutual aid services, it is not necessary to have a By-law enacted in every instance. A report approved by Council, contained recommendations that it would be sufficient for the City to enter into mutual aid agreements with specified municipalities, subject to approved terms and conditions. Again, such a report would be confirmed by a By-law at the end of Council. Ottawa Fire Services anticipates bringing these agreements forward in Q3 2007. Ottawa City Council as well as the respective Councils of the neighbouring municipalities will approve these agreements.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 2 at December 31, 2008

Management: % complete *100%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 2

The By-law received Council approval in September 2009. The provision in section 19 address the Fire Chief's authority to leave municipal limits

OAG: % complete *100%*

2006 Recommendation 3

That the Ottawa Fire Services, in concert with both the OMBI and Fire Marshal initiatives, develop a comprehensive set of performance measures that adequately reflect its strategic and operational objectives in order to provide adequate performance information to Council.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

As part of the Corporate Planning and Performance Reporting Office (CPPRO), performance measures were established and Fire Services has been reporting on these measures for the past year. A comprehensive set of performance measures was also established for Fire Services through the OMBI group, which are currently being reported to Council through the established OMBI reporting process. These measures include Residential Fire Related Injuries per 100,000 population (3 measures - Urban, Rural and Entire Municipality); Percentage of all Residential Fire Related Injuries in Dwellings with a Working Smoke Alarm (entire Municipality); Rate of Firefighter Injuries (entire Municipality); Residential Fire Related Fatalities per 100,000 population (3 measures - Urban, Rural and Entire Municipality); Rate of Residential Structural Fires with Losses per 1,000 households (3 measures - Urban, Rural and Entire Municipality); Rate of Commercial and Industrial Structural Fires with Losses per 1,000 properties (3 measures again); Total Fire Operating Costs per Capita (Urban Operations); Number of Incidents Responded to by Fire Services per 1,000 population (Urban); Number of Property Fires, Explosions and Alarms per

1,000 population (Urban); Number of Rescues per 1,000 population (Urban); Number of Medical Calls per 1,000 population (Urban); Number of Other Incidents per 1,000 population (Urban); Operating Costs for Fire Services per \$1,000 Assessment. The remaining reporting requirements, such as the station notification times, are subject to further implementation of modules within the Records Management System (RMS) anticipated in 2008. In addition to the prescribed OMBI measures, Fire Services agrees to provide an annual report to Council that reflect performance against strategic and operational objects as cited in Management's response to Auditor recommendation # 4 provided appropriate resources can be secured.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 3 at December 31, 2008

Management: % complete *100%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 3

OMBI data dictionary, indicator profiles and explanatory factors packages received and reviewed for 2007 and preliminary 2008. Obtained and reviewed annual OMBI report to Council, including high-level "public" fire metrics. OMBI measurement toolkit will meet reporting requirements in combination with response time data enumerated under Recommendation 4.

OAG: % complete *100%*

2006 Recommendation 4

That the Ottawa Fire Services develop an annual reporting mechanism to provide Council with regular information on overall Branch performance against objectives and performance measures, including the results of all major fire events.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Ottawa Fire Services will report annually, through Standing Committee, as directed above including updates on Branch performance and a consolidated summary of major events from the previous year in Q2 each year. In addition, Fire Services will continue to report its performance through the existing mechanisms such as the Corporate Annual Report, OMBI Annual Report and the Quarterly Performance Report to Council.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 4 at December 31, 2008

Fire Services is continuing to develop an annual reporting mechanism and implementation plan. The first annual report is expected to come forward to Council in Q2 2009.

Management: % complete *50%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 4

Underlying data tracking/measurement tools are in place. At the time of the follow-up, initial Council report on annual performance results versus targets was scheduled for September 2009. The report is to include response time performance data that can be drilled down to Fire Station specific analyses. Primary performance measurement focus will be to compare Ottawa performance over time in order to set meaningful future targets.

OAG: % complete *50%*

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 4 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding.

The first annual report was delivered to Community and Protective Services Committee on September 3, 2009. Further work will be undertaken in 2010 to fully meet the intent of this recommendation.

Management: % complete *50%*

2006 Recommendation 5

That the Ottawa Fire Services complete the current risk assessment and station location study on a priority basis and ensure that opportunities for efficiencies are identified.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

In 2004, Council approved funding for a Station Location Study. The study is currently underway and includes a partnership between Ottawa Fire Services and the Ontario Fire Marshal's Office. Part of the study includes the development of a risk assessment for the City of Ottawa based on the local available data. The final report is anticipated to be completed in Q3 2007 and will reflect opportunities for efficiencies and growth driven service requirements that are identified through the study. This report will also provide sufficient information to Council in order for them to approve emergency service response standards for the Fire Service based on the Ontario Fire Marshal's Public Fire Safety Guidelines.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 5 at December 31, 2008

Management: % complete *100%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 5

Automated risk assessment model demonstrated by staff, and model functionality regarding station location analysis assessed by audit follow-up team. Station location study obtained and reviewed by audit follow-up team. Council report on station location efficiency opportunities obtained and reviewed by audit follow-up team. Independent consultant "computer model 3rd party technical assessment" verification letter/study obtained and reviewed. Model supported by independent peer review. OFS risk assessment model is rigorous operational planning tool.

OAG: % complete

100%

2006 Recommendation 6

That once the current risk assessment and station location study is completed, the Ottawa Fire Services establish a process for regularly re-assessing fire risks in the community.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Once the risk assessment is approved by Council, Fire Services will be able to and are committed to regularly updating risks based on updates to input information (i.e., population density, building density etc.). The Public Fire Safety Guidelines (04-45-03) recommend that a municipality update their risk assessment every three years. Given the automated nature of the new risk assessment, the Ottawa Fire Services will be able to update their risk assessment regularly.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 6 at December 31, 2008

Management: % complete

100%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 6

Independent confirmation by audit follow-up team that risk assessment model (computer application) can be updated with revised input data to support future scheduled updates.

OAG: % complete

100%

2006 Recommendation 7

That the Ottawa Fire Services pursue the use of fire fighter resources to conduct 'in-service' inspections in order to enhance its current inspection program.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Ottawa Fire Services will continue using fire fighter resources to conduct 'in-service inspections' in support of specific targeted programs as has been done in the past. The current 'in-service' inspection program has focused on vulnerable communities such as elderly and the Wake-Up-Get a Working Smoke Alarm program, which has been highly successful and well received throughout the City. In the future, other programs such as barbeque inspection and kitchen inspection are also being considered as a means of promoting life safety within our community. However, to use front line fire fighter resources for Code enforcement inspections would be cost prohibitive. Extensive training from the Ontario Fire College is required before being qualified to complete Fire Code enforcement inspections. In addition, that training is required to be maintained on a regular basis, which would also result in additional training cost being incurred by the Branch.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 7 at December 31, 2008

Management: % complete ***100%***

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 7

"Wake Up" smoke alarm program delivered by firefighter "in service" - inspections conducted in annual fall and spring blitzes. To date 51,712 reported visits. Smoke alarm/battery installs of 8,774. Non-compliance rate of 39% at program initiation. In 2008 the program non-compliance rate was 15%. 2008 non-compliance now below Provincial average compared to 2005 when double the Provincial average. Program funded with \$1.3 million in community corporate grants with \$200,000 property tax portion from City. Fire fatality rates at program initiation were typically 6-9 persons annually but are now hovering around 2 persons - measurable program impact delivered by audit process.

OAG: % complete ***100%***

2006 Recommendation 8

That the City re-assign responsibility for all hydrant inspections to Drinking Water Services and re-instate inspections of hydrants on City and privately owned properties on a cost-recovery basis.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

This decision would expedite hydrant inspections, performed by Ottawa Fire Services, since a record of the hydrant inspection would be readily available from City records.

Private hydrant inspections on City owned land was provided on a limited basis by Drinking Water Services in the past, but it was assumed by RPAM as a result of a Universal Program Review reduction. As a result RPAM developed a regulatory-

compliant Preventive Maintenance Program that provides an effective tracking system through a database. This service is contracted out and RPAM has contractual obligations ending on December 31, 2007. RPAM recommends that the decision for changing the current practice should be based on a cost-comparison analysis.

Drinking Water Services can't take on the responsibility of service without additional resources. However, if directed by Council, to take on the inspection service for hydrants on both City owned and private property, staff would first assess the level of service to these private hydrants to ensure full compliance with regulations and provide a report outlining the budget requirements, potential liability implications and preferred service delivery method. The cost for this service could be recovered on a fee for service basis, as was the case previously.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 8 at December 31, 2008

Further to a report to PEC and CPSC, which was carried at Council on August 28, 2008, Fire Services and Water and Wastewater branches will work cooperatively to monitor the location of private hydrants and to promote inspection and maintenance, but will not assume responsibility for care. The report involved some suggested changes in service level, and stakeholder consultation, which will occur prior to implementation. Drinking Water Services is responsible for ensuring that all hydrants on the City right-of-way comply with the Fire Code regulations and undertakes regular hydrant inspections, maintenance and repairs, pressure and flow tests, tagging, marking, painting and snow removal.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 8

OFS analysis regarding potential shift rotation efficiency savings (i.e., \$123,000 annually) by eliminating overtime callouts was obtained and reviewed by audit follow-up team. Public awareness consultation committed to in joint approach with Drinking Water Services is 100% complete.

Council report confirming OFS and Drinking Water Services roles and responsibilities was obtained and reviewed by the audit follow-up team. Various project status update e-mails obtained and reviewed. Initial OFS public awareness consultations occurred in spring 2008. A By-law establishing fees, private hydrant registration process, and hydrant tagging business rules in production by Drinking Water staff, however, delays have occurred in obtaining the required IT support for hydrant monitoring software application. Achieving the planned Fall 2009 launch date appears unlikely.

OAG: % complete **50%**

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 8 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding.

The new Fire Chief and the Environmental Services Department will meet in 2010 to discuss this recommendation.

Management: % complete **50%**

2006 Recommendation 9

That the Ottawa Fire Services pursue opportunities to enhance the investigation program including:

- a) placing investigators on shifts vs. the current overtime/on call approach; and,
- b) establishing a follow-up with on-site crews as part of the investigation process.

2006 Management Response

- a) Management is supportive of the notion to review a shift rotation model for investigators and to complete a detailed cost/benefit analysis of implementing a potential plan. However, any movement in this direction would require a memorandum of understanding to be added to the collective agreement and will require negotiation with respect to the collective agreement between the City of Ottawa and the Ottawa Professional Firefighters' Association (OPFFA).
- b) Management agrees with the recommendation. Currently there is a follow-up between investigators and on-site crews as part of the fire investigation process.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 9 at December 31, 2008

A 2008 arbitration had no impact on this recommendation, which still requires negotiation of an MOU with the OPFFA. OFS management will propose a rotation model again in the next round of bargaining.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 9

Implementation will not proceed in foreseeable future. OFS due diligence to support collective bargaining process was 100% achieved.

New collective bargaining agreement does not include the provisions required to execute shift based investigation model. Shift based investigation resources continue to be a future bargaining issue - no implementation possible at this point in time.

OAG: % complete **0%**

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 9 as of Winter 2010

Management disagrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding with regard to implementation of this recommendation.

The recommendation was to "pursue opportunities to enhance the investigation program including... placing investigators on shifts..." As the OAG notes, OFS due diligence was 100% achieved. Management pursued the opportunity, and as a result of the 2008 arbitration a shift based investigation model cannot be implemented at this time. Implementation of this recommendation is considered complete.

Management: % complete ***100%***

2006 Recommendation 10

That the Ottawa Fire Services pursue the use of Fire Fighter resources to conduct certain types of fire investigations in order to enhance the current investigation program.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation and has been implementing a solution over the past several years.

In 2002, the Fire Prevention Service Delivery Model approved by Council, included a fire investigations' component that identified the use of fire suppression staff to complete some fire investigations as well as a recommendation to Council that Fire Services increase the number of fires thoroughly investigated.

In an effort to achieve these recommendations, the Ottawa Fire Services signed a Memorandum of Understanding in 2003 with the Ontario Fire Marshal (OFM). The agreement was to allow Ottawa Fire Services to deliver the provincial "Fire Cause Determination" course locally, resulting in a lower cost and an accelerated pace of delivery. Currently, there are approximately 260 individuals who have received various levels of the Fire Investigator's Course allowing Ottawa Fire Services to be compliant with the legislation in that all fires are now being investigated. This allows our highly trained Fire Investigation staff to concentrate on those incidents that involve incendiary cause, which include our law enforcement partners - increasing the number of more thorough investigations. Fire Service intends to train all front-line firefighters at the basic level in the next several years.

Acquiring full investigator competencies in the front-line staff would be cost prohibitive based on the extensive multi-year training required not only through the Ontario Fire College but also the two-week course required by NFPA 921 and the Out of Country training provided by Police Services of Ontario.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 10 at December 31, 2008

The Special Operations Unit in Fire Services has put the mechanisms in place in order to perform this function.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 10

Council report establishing Fire Prevention Service Delivery Model obtained and reviewed by audit follow-up team - can confirm role of fire suppression staff in executing lower level investigations. Training documentation confirms rollout to more than 260 frontline fire fighters. Independent review of records management software confirms widespread documentation of investigations qualifications across all stations.

OAG: % complete **100%**

2006 Recommendation 11

That the Ottawa Fire Services pursue the development of a public education program related to false alarms.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Fire Services will be reporting back in Q4 2007 to Standing Committee after completing a follow up review of findings from comparable municipalities who have recently implemented false alarm programs to determine feasibility of a program in Ottawa.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 11 at December 31, 2008

The development of a public education program related to false alarms will be pursued in Q3 2009.

Management: % complete **50%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 11

Audit follow-up team confirms records management system false alarm data tracking executed in 2006-07. Obtained 2007 Council report containing analysis - confirmed risk management based approach to target false alarm events for purposes of public education. The "Top 25" repeat offender education program has been designed (i.e., education materials) and target properties identified. At the time of the follow-up, execution of the designed public education was scheduled to rollout across Q3-4 2009.

OAG: % complete **50%**

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 11 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding. A report has been written and is scheduled to come forward in Q2 2010.

Management: % complete

50%

2006 Recommendation 12

That the Ottawa Fire Services implement a formal management-led incident debriefing process, including a standard format for discussion and documentation of all findings and recommendations and report the results on all major incidents to senior management.

2006 Management Response

Management does not agree with the recommendation.

The current debriefing sessions for incidents are currently conducted at the appropriate operational level of the organization based on severity of the incident. The organizational structure within the Fire Services is as follows: Fire Chief, Deputy Fire Chiefs, Platoon Chiefs, District Chiefs, Captain, Lieutenants and Firefighters. The Incident Commander at a call could be a Captain, District Chief or a Platoon Chief depending on the severity of the incident. This is the senior person at the call and is therefore, the best-positioned staff to manage a debriefing session, as they were present and participated in the call. Feedback from the debriefing sessions is then provided to the Fire Chief and Deputy Fire Chief(s) – Management - through a variety of formal processes. The management team then provides direction on changes at a strategic level such as changes to coordination of other City services, tactics and policy and procedures necessary to address weaknesses identified through the debriefing session in an effort to ensure staff are better prepared in the future. Fire management can and do request and receive additional information that they may require on any incident in order to make necessary recommendations on improving services.

Ottawa Fire Services' debriefing process is the following:

- The incident commander submits a form, which included time of incident, damage, name of injured and the apparatus that responded, to the Platoon Office which in turn signs the form and submits it to all Deputy Chiefs and the Fire Chief
- Fires of 3rd alarm (fire requiring eight pump trucks, three ladder trucks, a heavy rescue truck and additional support vehicles in a hydrant area) or greater have a Deputy Fire Chief in attendance
- For all 3rd alarm fires or greater, the Platoon Chief meets with the Deputy for incident management critique

- A formal incident debriefing is held the next shift with most first response stations in attendance along with the Dispatcher that handled the call and the Investigator if available
- Recommendations from Incident Commanders on major fires are discussed at the monthly Platoon Chief/Deputy Chief meetings
- Incident report filed on major fires by Incident Commander with recommendations on equipment, response and tactics
- All Safety Officers complete a report on all “Working Fires”. Any reports identifying problems or issues are submitted to the Deputy Chief of Operations for follow up and disposition.
- Issues from Incident Reports are brought forward to Health and Safety Committee, which is co-chaired by the Deputy Chief of Prevention and Training, for discussion and action. These actions are then submitted to Management Team through the Committee Co-chair for implementation.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 12 at December 31, 2008

This item was discussed at CAWG on November 21, 2008 and will go to Council for approval in the next quarterly report. Implementation of this recommendation is being reviewed as part of the corporate realignment initiative. Expected completion is Q2 2009.

Management: % complete *50%*

OAG’s Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 12

Following the audit a structured, multi-level debriefing process has been implemented. The process uses incident severity “screening” to determine which levels of management engage in the various incident follow-up protocols. The screening process has been documented in an OFS eight step business rule. OFS senior management become involved in escalated incidents passing through the screening model, and the records management software tracks incident resolution. Incident briefing progression through the screening has been independently inspected in the records management software by the audit follow-up team.

OAG: % complete *100%*

2006 Recommendation 13

That the Ottawa Fire Services develop a consolidated Long-Range Strategic Plan that outlines its future role and its strategy regarding the types of resources, training and skills that will be required in the future to best ensure public safety.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Ottawa Fire Services is in the initial stages of planning and has begun to develop a format and approach for the next stages for longer range planning anticipated to be complete in 2008.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 13 at December 31, 2008

Deloitte Consulting has been retained to undertake this work. Expected completion is Q2 2009.

Management: % complete 25%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 13

External consulting resources have been secured by OFS. High-level work plan prepared and introduced via a kick-off meeting to OFS management. Work plan obtained and reviewed by audit follow-up team. Project initiation delayed until Phase 3 City-wide restructuring complete. Project completion timeframes may be impacted by current process to hire new Chief and ensure his input.

Strategic Plan will integrate with overall Emergency and Protective Services planning exercise, including upcoming Paramedic Services master plan. Expected completion is Q4 2009 – year later than forecast. Time lag not problematic given creation of EPS and need for integrated strategic planning across services.

OAG: % complete 10%

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 13 as of Winter 2010

Management disagrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that there has been little or no action to implement this recommendation.

To date, work has been completed on the development of a draft strategic plan. Given that a new Fire Chief began January 2010, it is necessary to review the draft document prior to finalization. Management considers this recommendation partially complete.

Management: % complete 50%

2006 Recommendation 14

That the Ottawa Fire Services revise its management structure by creating additional managerial positions below the Deputy Chief position, utilizing existing vacancies.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation in principle.

The Ottawa Fire Services Branch agrees that additional managerial positions are required below the Deputy Chief position, however the issue is currently before an

Interest Board of Arbitration regarding the Collective Agreement between the City of Ottawa and the Ottawa Professional Firefighters' Association.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 14 at December 31, 2008

This item was discussed at CAWG on November 21, 2008. Implementation of this recommendation is being reviewed as part of the corporate realignment initiative. Expected completion is Q2 2009.

Management: % complete *50%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 14

The recent arbitration has given Fire Services the latitude it needs to create an unlimited number of Assistant Deputy Chief positions and allows management to move work out of the bargaining unit. Specifically, Fire Services is planning to reorganize in Q2 2009 by deleting the Platoon Chief position and changing it to an Assistant Deputy Chief position (MPE). Assistant Deputy Chiefs will be the individuals between the Deputy and District Chiefs and they will be directly involved in post-incident analysis. OFS confirmed that the recent arbitration was very favourable and enables management to proceed with implementation of recommendations in the Fire Services Audit.

Deputy Assistant Chief positions have been developed, including position profiles and qualifications. OFS staffing model and budget efficiencies (using budgeted vacant FTEs) will ensure no net fiscal impact from implementing the new Deputy Assistant Chief positions. Remaining implementation progress focused on the HR process to actually post and fill positions.

OAG: % complete *50%*

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 14 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding. This is currently under review by the new Fire Chief.

Management: % complete *50%*

2006 Recommendation 15

That the Ottawa Fire Services explore other potential opportunities to revise its management structure including:

- a) **Assigning Platoon Chiefs to non-shift regular hours;**
- b) **Exchanging the existing non-unionized Rural Sector Chief positions with the existing Platoon Chief positions.**

2006 Management Response

- a) Management disagrees with the recommendation. The Collective Agreement between the City of Ottawa and the Ottawa Professional Firefighters' Association and the Fire Protection and Prevention Act prescribe the hours of work and shift rotation to be utilized in the Fire Service Suppression and Operations' Divisions. Accordingly, it would not be possible to assign these individuals to non-shift hours. To remove the position from the Platoon would require the consent of the Firefighters' Association, as it would be a collective bargaining issue. Secondly, it is important to note that the Platoon Chiefs are the sole persons in charge of each of four platoons in the 24/7 operations. They are the most senior person on duty citywide – including the rural areas, in the absence of Fire management, to provide oversight on behalf of the City. While management advocates that additional management positions are required overall per Auditor recommendation #14, the operations require oversight at the Platoon Chief level 24/7.
- b) Management disagrees with the recommendation. Currently Ottawa Fire Services enjoys the service of a successful Volunteer Complement of approximately 400 Firefighters. At amalgamation, after careful consideration, a decision was made to create the rural management positions as excluded from any bargaining unit. The Rural Sector Chief is a unique position that manages the recruitment, training, retention, oversight and termination of volunteer (non-unionized) firefighters. Their job is non-traditional in nature where they manage operations as well as act as a community liaison between the community they serve and the Ottawa Fire Services. Their hours are irregular by definition with training and other work required in the evenings and weekends when the volunteers are available after traditional work hours. This particular job type does not fit within the Collective Agreement between the City of Ottawa and the Ottawa Professional Firefighters' Association and it is appropriate that the Rural Sector Chief positions remain Management and Professional Exempt (MPE) positions

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 15 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 50% complete. This item was discussed at CAWG on November 21, 2008 and will go to Council for approval in the next quarterly report. Implementation of this recommendation is being reviewed as part of the corporate realignment initiative. Expected completion is Q2 2009.

Management: % complete 50%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 15

Management disagreed with recommendation 15 related to possible organizational changes. Management has chosen to focus on Recommendation 14 as the preferred

option to address the common audit objective of enhanced OFS management resources/capacity and leadership. As such, Recommendation 15 has not been implemented.

OAG: % complete *0%*

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 15 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding. This is currently under review by the new Fire Chief.

Management: % complete *0%*

2006 Recommendation 16

That the City realign its Labour Relations resources in order to provide additional support to the OFS.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Labour Relations' Management agrees with the recommendation in principle, however resource constraints preclude any action being taken at this time.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 16 at December 31, 2008

An enhanced service delivery model in Q2 2009 will have both a Senior LRC (not entirely dedicated) and a LRC assigned to the OFS portfolio. Two Senior LRC positions were requested through the 2009 budget process and were deferred. The positions are still under review and may be resolved through the shared services restructuring model, which is currently underway and is expected to be complete in Q1 2009.

Management: % complete *50%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 16

OFS not driving implementation. City-wide "Shared Service Model" restructuring now underway. Optimal model requires on-site dedicated Labour Relations resources to EPS (consistent with relatively high measurable demand historically present in OFS and Paramedic Service areas). Implementation success of this recommendation tied to Shared Service Model report/findings to be delivered in late 2009.

OAG: % complete *10%*

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 16 as of Winter 2010

Management disagrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that there has been little or no action taken to implement this recommendation.

The Labour Relations branch, which now forms part of the City Clerk and Solicitor department, is a centre of expertise and does not form part of the shared services review. In order to help meet the demands of clients including Ottawa Fire Services, the Labour Relations branch has been consolidated with the Legal Services' Litigation branch, with the goal of providing internal clients with a blend of resources. These include assigned primary and secondary Labour Relations Consultants and a Senior Labour Relations Consultant, along with the support of several Legal Counsel knowledgeable in labour, employment, and human rights matters. Some fine-tuning remains. The recommendation is considered substantially complete.

Management: % complete

50%

2006 Recommendation 17

That the Ottawa Fire Services develop a set of core competencies for all officer positions and incorporate these into the job requirements in order to better facilitate merit-based promotions and succession planning.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

It is important to note that the incorporation of competencies into the job requirements will require a major concession with respect to the provisions of the Collective Agreement between the City of Ottawa and the Ottawa Professional Firefighters' Association - which continues to advocate promotions based on seniority rather than on merit. Consequently, in order to enhance the promotional system in this manner, a revision to the Collective Agreement is required. In the interim Fire management believes that identification of core competencies for various job types in the Branch will allow the Service to provide training around those core competencies in an effort to ensure that although staff are currently being promoted to a great extent on a seniority basis, they have acquired the skills necessary to do the job. To accomplish this recommendation, significant support and expertise from the Employee Services COE will be required.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 17 at December 31, 2008

Twelve core competencies have been identified consistent with the Ontario Fire Services Standards for Officers. In order to implement the remainder of this recommendation, an amendment to the current collective agreement would be

required. This is presently being negotiated as part of the current round of collective bargaining.

Management: % complete ***90%***

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 17

Core competencies developed and reviewed by audit follow-up team. Management and OPFFA promotions process review committee established under revised collective bargaining agreement (Article 15). Committee findings will address merit based promotion and succession planning issues. OFS Management expect a report from committee in 2010.

OAG: % complete ***75%***

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 17 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding.

This issue was successfully negotiated and signed off on April 17th, 2009. Union and management have formed a committee to develop a revised promotional system.

Management: % complete ***75%***

2006 Recommendation 18

That the Ottawa Fire Services:

- a) **Examine the business processes related to incident reporting to ensure all information is captured as efficiently and effectively as possible;**
- b) **Explore the potential to consolidate its information systems activities on a Branch-wide basis; and,**
- c) **In concert with Employee Services, integrate the Volunteer payroll with the corporate payroll system.**

2006 Management Response

- a) Management agrees with the recommendation. Fire Services is currently undergoing a business process review related to incident reporting in an effort to improve the process for capturing information and to assist in ensuring accuracy.
- b) Management agrees with the recommendation. Ottawa Fire Services contemplates being able to achieve consolidation of information on a branch-wide basis with the full implementation of all modules within their RMS anticipated for 2009.
- c) Management agrees with the recommendation. The City is currently exploring alternate options for paying the volunteer firefighters.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 18 at December 31, 2008

- a) The business processes have been reviewed through a detailed look at the standard Incident Report required from the Province. A team was established to provide hands-on input and resulted in a new form being produced for use on January 1, 2009. The new form will be available electronically by June 1st, 2009 once the next upgrade of the software is completed and Fire personnel have completed their training on the use of the form.
- b) Fire Services has eliminated previous manual and electronic processes and has migrated all branch-wide reporting to the Fire Services records management software system. All inputting and reporting is contained within one system with new modules being added as required.
- c) An IT project was initiated to explore alternate options for paying volunteer firefighters. The project is currently in the analysis and business case evaluation phase. A design has been approved and data specification will be completed by the end of February 2009. It is anticipated that the SAP build component will be completed by Q3 2009. In addition, the Fire Department Management (FDM) system requires adjustment to automate an interface from FDM to SAP. The timeline for completion of this build is yet to be determined.

<i>Management: % complete (a)</i>	100%
<i>Management: % complete (b)</i>	90%
<i>Management: % complete (c)</i>	10%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 18

Manual for Provincial incident reporting application (to meet new mandatory reporting format) now completed and reviewed. New on-line and hard copy forms obtained and reviewed. Initial June Go Live report under the new format to be obtained and reviewed when sent to Province. Records management software demonstration confirms OFS reporting readiness.

Records management software has successfully executed 18b) requirement. RMS functionality has been demonstrated to audit follow-up team.

Payroll integration business case reviewed for 18c). Payroll integration project technical specifications obtained and reviewed. Build expected by end of 2009.

<i>OAG: % complete (a)</i>	100%
<i>OAG: % complete (b)</i>	100%
<i>OAG: % complete (c)</i>	25%

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 18 as of Winter 2010

Management disagrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that action has been initiated to implement this recommendation but it is not yet considered partially complete.

All of the requirements have been developed and provided to the SAP group and payroll divisions. Work to transfer the pay data has been completed by both the Ottawa Fire Services and the Payroll Division. It is anticipated that the first volunteer payroll will be run in Q2 2010. SAP IT has submitted its project close-out report. Management considers this recommendation substantially complete.

Management: % complete (c) ***90%***

2006 Recommendation 19

That the Community and Protective Services Department explore the potential for,

- a) Integrating its management information activities;
- b) Consolidating its communications centre operations on a Department-wide basis.

2006 Management Response

- a) Management agrees with the recommendation. Currently, Ottawa Fire Services has implemented five modules within their RMS: incident reporting, prevention (inspections/property module), training, personnel, and permits modules. Currently being implemented is the asset management/preventive maintenance module with early meetings beginning to look at implementing the Roster Module, which is expected to be operational within the next 24 months. With this information available, Fire Services could provide performance reporting against performance standards in addition to the reports currently being provided per the Auditor's recommendation 3 & 4. This information could be reported on a branch basis in Q1 2008.
- b) Management does not agree with the recommendation. A consultant's report completed at amalgamation recommended that the Emergency Services consider co-locating their communication centres. However, preliminary costs for a consolidated communication centre were projected to be considerable and far outweighed the benefits the City was likely to realize. A significant benefit of consolidating a communication centre is the capability to share information. This has been achieved by the implementation of the new Fire CAD system, which is the same system that Ottawa Police use and now both services are sharing information and resources where appropriate. The Ministry of Health and Long Term Care (MOHLTC) controls the Paramedic Communication Centre, although managed by the City of Ottawa, under a contract to the

Province. Consequently, any changes to the Centre operations require approval by the Province. Some improvements have been made with information sharing by the limited implementation of the corporate radio system to the Paramedic Service. In addition, current technology allows for a seamless delivery of service to the citizens of Ottawa through the 911 system operated under contract by the Ottawa Police Service. Finally, a recent benchmarking review of seven By-law Services in the Province, revealed that it is not a best practice to co-locate By-law dispatching services with other City services.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 19 at December 31, 2008

- a) The Asset Management/Preventative Maintenance Module is 25% implemented but is not ready to roll out. It is expected that this module will not be fully completed until Q4 2011. The focus for 2009 will be on implementing the Roster Module. Due to staffing vacancies, the Roster Module will not commence implementation until Q4 2009, with full implementation expected in Q3 2010 (see recommendation 20).
- b) This recommendation is 100% complete further to discussion at the October 18, 2007 and February 25, 2008 meetings of CAWG and will go to Council for approval in the next quarterly report. As part of the 2008 budget deliberations, Council directed a review of the department's communications centre operations. A report on consolidated dispatch is presently being undertaken by a consultant and is expected in Q2 2009. The Auditor General indicated that he would be reviewing progress made in the 2009 follow-up audit.

<i>Management: % complete (a)</i>	<i>25%</i>
-----------------------------------	------------

<i>Management: % complete (b)</i>	<i>100%</i>
-----------------------------------	-------------

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 19

- a) The intent of this recommendation was to explore the potential for integrated management information across emergency services. Elements of this have been pursued in that the Fire Services and the Paramedic Service are to utilize the same scheduling system. No other initiatives were noted at the time of the follow-up.
- b) Consulting report to General Manager of EPS imminent regarding new EPS consolidated communications options/strategy (Council direction). Report not yet available to audit follow-up team. Paramedic Service dispatch will be exempt from consolidation (contracted Provincial service with no Ministry of Health consolidation mandate and its own pressing performance issues identified in upcoming audit report).

<i>OAG: % complete (a)</i>	<i>25%</i>
----------------------------	------------

<i>OAG: % complete (b)</i>	<i>20%</i>
----------------------------	------------

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 19 as of Winter 2010

- a) Management agrees with the OAG’s follow-up audit finding. Further exploration of the potential for integrated management information across emergency services will continue in 2010.
- b) Management disagrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that there has been little or no action taken to implement this recommendation.

In Q3 2009, the newly formed Emergency and Protective Services department received a report from an external consultant outlining the options and associated cost estimates for the construction of a consolidated dispatch. After a review of the report by all emergency services partners and select non-emergency partners it was determined that there are a series of potential opportunities to enhance interoperability and information sharing beyond just the consolidation of dispatch centres. Meetings between partners have been initiated. Once the partners have identified a series of options to enhance the interoperability and information sharing between services a report to all impacted governance bodies will be presented. Management considers this recommendation partially complete.

<i>Management: % complete (a)</i>	<i>25%</i>
-----------------------------------	------------

<i>Management: % complete (b)</i>	<i>50%</i>
-----------------------------------	------------

2006 Recommendation 20

That the Ottawa Fire Services pursue the implementation of the Rostering module on a priority basis and ensure that adequate orientation and training is provided to staff to facilitate its acceptance and use.

2006 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

To implement the Rostering module within the RMS planned by December 31, 2008. In order to complete the implementation of the Rostering module, Fire Services will need to:

- Upgrade the version of RMS from 4.2 to 6.0 (estimated time to do this is 1 year - IT resources are required for this) as FDM is currently only releasing Rostering in version 6.0.
- Hire a project and consultant team to train staff and resolve the issues. A work plan is currently being drafted.

A dedicated FTE is required to manage on an ongoing basis.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 20 at December 31, 2008

The IT business case for this project was approved in April 2008. The vendor delayed the rollout of the software. As a result, it is expected that implementation will commence in Q4 2009 and will be complete by Q3 2010.

Management: % complete *25%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 20

Automated Rostering IT business case was obtained and reviewed by audit follow-up team. IT project approved in Q2 2009, however, no critical path available/obtained yet to support OFS/IT Q3 2010 completion target.

OAG: % complete *25%*

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 20 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding.

The implementation of this recommendation has been dependant on the software vendor releasing a new version of the rostering module. As a result, OFS is pursuing other options to address this recommendation.

Management: % complete *25%*

4 SUMMARY OF THE LEVEL OF COMPLETION

The 20 recommendations contained in the Audit of the Ottawa Fire Services Branch conducted in 2006 were intended to function as an integrated package. The overall purpose of the recommendations was to drive progress towards risk management based service planning, optimal resource deployment guided by an appropriately resourced management structure, and performance measurement driven accountability and target setting. In order to achieve the objectives of the audit, significant changes in management processes, data management toolkits and organization culture were anticipated.

The table below outlines our assessment of the level of completion of each recommendation as of Fall 2009.

CATEGORY	% COMPLETE	RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL RECOMMENDATIONS
LITTLE OR NO ACTION	0 – 24	9, 13, 15 ¹ , 16, 19b	5	22%
ACTION INITIATED	25 – 49	18c, 19a, 20	3	13%
PARTIALLY COMPLETE	50 – 74	4, 8, 11, 14	4	17%
SUBSTANTIALLY COMPLETE	75 – 99	17	1	4%
COMPLETE	100	1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 10, 12, 18a, 18b	10	43%
TOTAL			23	100%

5 CONCLUSION

The highlights of Management’s “fully implemented” accomplishments pertaining to the audit recommendations include the following:

- Although Council approval was obtained two years later than originally anticipated, results based, measurable service delivery outcomes have been formalized in a new Establishing and Regulatory By-law, thereby adding long term stability to OFS financial, operational and service level planning.
- A risk management based service planning application (GIS enabled) has been designed and successfully implemented. Undertaken in cooperation with the Ontario Fire Marshal, this application models station location options and supports intelligent growth related service planning. It also supports station specific response time measurement and performance target setting.
- A new performance measurement framework has been designed using design inputs from OMBI and the Fire Marshal’s performance measurement project. Reporting to City Council with a comprehensive set of indicators, accomplishment and targets will proceed in September 2009.
- An Integrated Records Management System has been designed and implemented to consolidate numerous operational data sets concerning core suppression, rescue, inspection, public education, investigation and training activities.
- The “Wake Up” smoke alarm program has been delivered using already deployed “in service” staff. Since inception, the program has cut non-compliant smoke alarm inspection results by half. Since program inception Ottawa has experienced a significant reduction in annual fire fatality rates.

¹ Management disagreed with recommendation 15 related to possible organizational changes. Management has chosen to focus on Recommendation 14 as the preferred option to address the common audit objective of enhanced OFS management resources/capacity and leadership. As such, Recommendation 15 has not been implemented.

- Management capacity will be strengthened by the “no net cost” introduction of Assistant Deputy Chief positions. These positions will foster accountability, leadership and an enhanced results based culture across the OFS.
- A multi-layered fire incident de-briefing tool has been designed and implemented to ensure appropriate follow-up by appropriate levels of management (depending on the severity of the incident).

In addition to the above noted recommendations, the OFS has also made measurable progress on audit inspired initiatives such as strategic planning, integrated communications across the Emergency and Protective Services department, and false alarm risk mitigation. However, implementation of an automated rostering system remains well behind schedule.

Now that City-wide restructuring has largely proceeded, accelerated OFS progress on remaining audit recommendations should be possible. At the time of the follow-up audit, revised critical path information on outstanding audit recommendations were expected to be supplied/confirmed during Q3 2009.

A number of recommendations remain outstanding as follows:

- Placing investigators on shifts versus the current use of on-call and overtime remains a collective bargaining issue (recommendation 9);
- A long-range plan for the OFS remains a work-in progress (recommendation 13);
- Provision of adequate Labour Relations support to OFS remains unresolved (recommendation 16); and,
- Implementation of the automated rostering system remains outstanding and no critical path has been established for its completion (recommendation 19).

6 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We wish to express our appreciation for the cooperation and assistance afforded the audit team by management.