



Office of the Auditor General / Bureau du vérificateur général

FOLLOW-UP TO THE 2007 AUDIT OF STAFFING

2009

SUIVI DE LA VÉRIFICATION DE

LA DOTATION EN PERSONNEL DE 2007

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	i
RÉSUMÉ.....	v
1 INTRODUCTION	1
2 KEY FINDINGS OF THE ORIGINAL 2007 AUDIT OF STAFFING	1
3 STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF 2007 AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS ...	2
4 SUMMARY OF THE LEVEL OF COMPLETION	21
5 CONCLUSION.....	22
6 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT.....	24

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

The Follow-up to the 2007 Audit of Staffing was included in the Auditor General's 2009 Audit Plan.

The key findings of the original 2007 audit included:

- A lack of monitoring and oversight has led to inconsistencies in staffing activities;
- Cases of employees in a direct reporting relationship with a family member;
- 27% of competitions had candidates who did not meet the basic requirements of the position;
- 13% of successful candidates did not meet the basic requirements of the position;
- Nearly 30% of job offers were dated after the successful candidates had already started in their new positions; and,
- An outside recruitment firm was paid over \$280,000 for its role in the recruitment of four senior managers who were already working with or known to senior management.

Summary of the Level of Completion

The table below outlines our assessment of the level of completion of each recommendation as of Fall 2009.

CATEGORY	% COMPLETE	RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL RECOMMENDATIONS
LITTLE OR NO ACTION	0 – 24	6	1	5%
ACTION INITIATED	25 – 49	-	-	-
PARTIALLY COMPLETE	50 – 74	1, 3, 4, 7, 11	5	25%
SUBSTANTIALLY COMPLETE	75 – 99	2, 8, 16	3	15%
COMPLETE	100	5, 9, 10, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17, 18, 19, 20	11	55%
TOTAL			20	100%

Conclusion

The results of the follow-up audit indicate that the Employee Services Division (now Human Resources Department) has done a considerable amount of work in developing and integrating an impressive repertoire of staffing, recruitment and competition tools to support hiring managers and to ensure that the proper processes and documentation are used to substantiate staffing decisions.

However, one area of continued concern is that candidates are still being considered without meeting the minimum requirements of the position, and the controls currently in place are not sufficiently rigorous to prevent this from happening. The fact is that none of the competition files reviewed contained any equivalency rationale decision, nor was there any evidence provided to support the fact that where consensus cannot be reached, matters are escalated to a higher level of management and included in a report of staffing anomalies. Furthermore, management permits the use of exceptions.

By appointing personnel who do not meet the requirements of the positions, the organization risks having an unqualified workforce which can ultimately have an impact on program delivery.

While Employee Services Branch has taken a service and advisory role to hiring managers as “clients” with more authority delegated to them, it has not in turn sufficiently focused on its monitoring and oversight roles. There are no consequences to hiring managers who have adopted practices that are not within the spirit of the City of Ottawa’s policies.

The other area that needs to be further expanded into executables and measurables is the Human Resources Strategic Plan 2009-2011 called “Delivering Service Excellence through People”. The first section of the plan provides a macro level environmental scan of the talent management challenges facing employers at large as well as the City to attract and retain talent in the future. It reviews trends and pressures and provides a snapshot of the City’s employee profile. However, it now needs to move from a promise to a reality. It must address many more questions: How do you move past planning and into execution? What process, talent or technology investments will be necessary? What changes may be required in collective agreements? How can stakeholders work together to chart a course of action, execute on it and measure the results? The work completed to date does not sufficiently identify the anticipated gaps, priorities and strategies necessary to achieve the strategic business priorities and challenges of the City and, more importantly does not cascade these into departmental and branch action plans and initiatives with goals and expectations to drive efforts and results against stated objectives.

Management Comment

Management disagrees with some of the statements made in the follow-up audit report’s Conclusion section as indicated below.

Auditor:one area of continued concern is that candidates are still being considered without meeting the minimum requirements of the position...

Management: The Human Resources department conducts initial screening of candidates against the posted requirements and the application of the City’s equivalency guidelines, as required. On occasion, particularly for jobs with

technical requirements and where the application of an equivalency is required, the hiring manager is involved in making this assessment. In these instances, candidates who are deemed to have equivalent education and experience are considered to have met the minimum requirements of the position and as such, would be screened in for an interview.

While it is agreed that the rationale for application of equivalencies has not been consistently documented in the screening summary in the past, it will be documented on a go-forward basis. This finding on its own is not sufficient evidence to conclude that candidates do not meet requirements. Hiring managers continue to be required to sign off on the final selection of candidates and provide rationale for candidates who were not initially screened in by Human Resources.

Auditor: There are no consequences to hiring managers who have adopted practices that are not within the spirit of the City of Ottawa's policies.

Management: The findings of the follow-up audit indicate that there is a need to improve the documentation or record where staffing decisions have been challenged or escalated by HR. Management agrees that documentation of these instances can be improved upon and steps have been taken to do this. However, the follow-up audit did not uncover evidence that managers are adopting practices that are inconsistent with City staffing policies. There are consequences to managers who do not follow City of Ottawa policies. The Code of Conduct states that "Upon receiving written disclosure of an actual or potential breach of the Code, the Department Head shall either determine that no breach exists or take reasonable steps to ensure that the matter is addressed in the appropriate manner".

With regard to the Human Resources Strategic Plan 2009–2011 created in 2008, management agrees that the next phase is to develop a plan with executable and measurable actions that are linked to organizational objectives and workplans. This work has been initiated and will be completed by the end of 2010. The objective of the initial Plan was to create awareness and understanding of the talent issues facing the City.

Acknowledgement

We wish to express our appreciation for the cooperation and assistance afforded the audit team by management.

RÉSUMÉ

Introduction

Le Suivi de la vérification de la dotation en personnel de 2007 était prévu dans le Plan de vérification du Bureau du vérificateur général de 2009.

Les constatations principales de la vérification initiale de 2007 sont les suivantes :

- Une surveillance et un contrôle insuffisants entraînent un manque d'uniformité dans les activités de dotation;
- Des employés entretiennent un rapport hiérarchique direct avec un membre de leur famille;
- Dans 27 % des concours, les candidats ne répondaient pas aux exigences minimales du poste;
- Dans 13 % des concours, les candidats retenus ne répondaient pas aux exigences minimales du poste;
- Près de 30 % des offres d'emploi étaient datées postérieurement à l'entrée en fonction du candidat retenu;
- Une agence de recrutement a touché plus de 280 000 \$ pour son rôle dans le recrutement de quatre cadres supérieurs qui travaillaient déjà à la Ville ou que la haute direction connaissait.

Sommaire du degré d'achèvement

Le tableau ci-dessous présente notre évaluation du degré d'achèvement de chaque recommandation à l'automne 2009 :

CATÉGORIE	POURCENTAGE COMPLÉTÉ	RECOMMANDATIONS	NOMBRE DE RECOMMANDATIONS	POURCENTAGE DU TOTAL DES RECOMMANDATIONS
PEU OU PAS DE MESURES PRISES	0 – 24	6	1	5 %
ACTION AMORCÉE	25 – 49	-	-	-
COMPLÉTÉE EN PARTIE	50 – 74	1, 3, 4, 7, 11	5	25 %
PRATIQUEMENT COMPLÉTÉE	75 – 99	2, 8, 16	3	15 %
COMPLÉTÉE	100	5, 9, 10, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17, 18, 19, 20	11	55 %
TOTAL			20	100 %

Conclusion

Les résultats du suivi de la vérification indiquent que la Direction des services aux employés (actuellement le Service des ressources humaines) a réalisé un travail considérable en vue de l'élaboration et de l'intégration d'un répertoire

impressionnant d'outils de dotation, de recrutement et de concours afin d'appuyer les gestionnaires recruteurs et d'assurer que la documentation pertinente est réunie et que les processus adéquats sont suivis pour justifier les décisions en matière d'embauche.

Cependant, le fait que des candidatures de personnes qui ne satisfont pas aux exigences minimales du poste sont toujours examinées demeure un sujet de préoccupation constante, et les mesures de contrôle actuellement en place ne sont pas suffisamment rigoureuses pour en empêcher l'occurrence. Il est vrai que les équivalences accordées n'étaient expliquées dans aucun des dossiers examinés, de même qu'aucune preuve n'était fournie à l'appui du fait que si l'unanimité n'est pas obtenue, la question est transmise à un échelon supérieur et incluse dans un rapport des anomalies en matière de dotation. De plus, la direction tolère l'utilisation d'exceptions.

En nommant des employés qui ne satisfont pas aux exigences du poste, la corporation risque de se doter d'une main-d'œuvre non qualifiée, ce qui, à la longue, aura une incidence sur la prestation de programmes.

Bien que la Direction des services aux employés ait assumé un rôle de service et de conseil auprès des gestionnaires recruteurs à titre de « clients » à qui plus de pouvoirs ont été délégués, elle ne s'est pas suffisamment concentrée sur ses rôles de contrôle et de surveillance. Il n'y a aucune conséquence à l'embauche de gestionnaires qui ont adopté des pratiques qui ne correspondent pas à l'esprit des politiques de la Ville d'Ottawa.

Le Plan stratégique des Ressources humaines 2009-2011, intitulé « Fournir des services d'excellence par l'entremise des personnes » est un autre secteur qui doit être encore plus développé en exécutable et mesurable. La première partie du plan donne une image environnementale, au macroéchelon, des défis en matière de gestion des talents auxquels les employeurs, de façon générale, ainsi que la Ville feront face en vue d'attirer et de retenir des personnes talentueuses à l'avenir. Les tendances et les pressions y sont examinées et un instantané du profil des employés de la Ville y est donné. Cependant, il faut maintenant faire de la promesse une réalité. Le plan doit aborder de nombreuses autres questions : Comment passe-t-on de la planification à la mise en œuvre? Quels investissements en processus, en talent ou en technologie seront nécessaires? Quels changements pourraient être requis relativement aux conventions collectives? Comment les intervenants peuvent-ils travailler de concert afin d'élaborer un plan d'action, de le mettre à exécution et d'en mesurer les résultats? Le travail accompli à ce jour ne cerne pas suffisamment les priorités, les stratégies et les écarts prévus nécessaires pour atteindre les priorités opérationnelles stratégiques et adresser les défis de la Ville et, de façon plus importante encore, ne les concrétise pas en des plans d'action ou des initiatives des services ou des directions dotés de cibles et d'attentes visant à poursuivre des efforts et des résultats en fonction des objectifs énoncés.

Commentaires de la direction

La direction n'est pas d'accord avec certaines des déclarations émises dans la conclusion de la vérification de suivi, comme il est indiqué ci-dessous.

Vérificateur : *le fait que des candidatures de personnes qui ne satisfont pas aux exigences minimales du poste sont toujours examinées demeure un sujet de préoccupation constante ...*

Direction : Le Service des ressources humaines effectue une sélection initiale des candidats selon les exigences affichées et l'application des lignes directrices en matière d'équivalence de la Ville, le cas échéant. Il arrive que, notamment pour les emplois qui requièrent des exigences techniques et pour lesquels l'application de l'équivalence est requise, le gestionnaire recruteur participe à ladite évaluation. Dans ces cas-là, on considère que les candidats qui sont jugés avoir une éducation et une expérience équivalentes ont satisfait aux exigences minimales du poste et ils sont donc invités à une entrevue.

Même s'il est entendu que, par le passé, le principe d'application des équivalences n'a pas été documenté de façon systématique dans le résumé d'évaluation, il le sera désormais. Cette constatation seule ne constitue pas une preuve suffisante permettant de conclure que les candidats ne satisfont pas aux exigences. Les gestionnaires recruteurs doivent toujours apposer leur signature en guise d'approbation du choix final des candidats et expliquer la logique qui les a menés à embaucher un candidat qui n'avait pas été retenu à l'origine par les Ressources humaines.

Vérificateur : *Il n'y a aucune conséquence pour les gestionnaires recruteurs qui ont adopté des pratiques qui ne correspondent pas à l'esprit des politiques de la Ville.*

Direction : Les constatations de la vérification de suivi indiquent qu'il est nécessaire d'améliorer la documentation ou le dossier relativement aux décisions de dotation remises en question ou renvoyées à un échelon supérieur par les Ressources humaines. La direction est d'accord que la documentation de ces cas-là peut être améliorée et des mesures ont été prises à cet égard. Toutefois, la vérification de suivi n'a trouvé aucune preuve comme quoi les gestionnaires adoptent des pratiques qui ne sont pas conformes aux politiques de dotation de la Ville. Il y a des conséquences pour les gestionnaires recruteurs qui ne se prêtent pas aux politiques de la Ville d'Ottawa. Le Code de conduite stipule que « sur réception d'un avis écrit d'une infraction réelle ou potentielle au Code, le chef du service soit conclut que l'infraction est inexistante soit prend des mesures raisonnables pour veiller à ce que l'affaire soit réglée correctement ».

En ce qui a trait au Plan stratégique des Ressources humaines 2009-2011, lequel a été élaboré en 2008, la direction est d'accord que la prochaine phase consiste à établir un plan contenant des mesures réalisables et mesurables liées aux objectifs organisationnels et aux plans de travail. Ce travail est entamé et sera achevé d'ici la

fin 2010. Le plan initial visait à promouvoir la sensibilisation aux enjeux relatifs aux talents auxquels la Ville fait face et à en faciliter la compréhension.

Remerciements

Nous tenons à remercier la direction pour la coopération et l'assistance accordées à l'équipe de vérification.

1 INTRODUCTION

The Follow-up to the 2007 Audit of Staffing was included in the Auditor General's 2009 Audit Plan.

The key findings of the original 2007 audit included:

- A lack of monitoring and oversight has led to inconsistencies in staffing activities;
- Cases of employees in a direct reporting relationship with a family member;
- 27% of competitions had candidates who did not meet the basic requirements of the position;
- 13% of successful candidates did not meet the basic requirements of the position;
- Nearly 30% of job offers were dated after the successful candidates had already started in their new positions; and,
- An outside recruitment firm was paid over \$280,000 for its role in the recruitment of four senior managers who were already working with or known to senior management.

2 KEY FINDINGS OF THE ORIGINAL 2007 AUDIT OF STAFFING

Accountability

Human Resources Framework

Generally accepted management principles require that an organization have a human resources strategy or plan in place, and that this statement of overall direction be supported by more detailed planning documents and a comprehensive set of policies and procedures.

The City of Ottawa does not have a comprehensive human resources strategy that identifies future directions linked to business requirements. The 2006 Human Resources Plan outlines full time equivalent (FTE) changes from 2000 to 2006 and projections for 2007, but does not encompass environmental scans nor does it identify anticipated gaps, priorities and strategies linked to business priorities and challenges. We have identified the lack of comprehensive strategy in some of our other audits, such as our audits of building services, fleet, financial control environment, food inspections and surface operations.

In terms of policies and procedures, the City has a number of human resources policy documents relating to various areas that are available both in hard copy as well as accessible to City employees via the intranet. Guidelines, procedures, forms

and checklists also support City policies. These are sufficient but there are no controls in place to ensure that they are followed and adhered to by hiring managers.

Accountability and delegation

In the existing system, accountability is shared between Employee Services Branch and the hiring managers. There needs to be a shift in culture to restore accountability to the hiring manager and for Employee Services Branch to take a greater role in the elaboration of HR strategies, plans, training, monitoring, reporting and oversight.

The role of Employee Services would be to encourage and safeguard the highest standards of integrity, risk management, and internal control and oversight. At this stage, it is focusing on transactions and providing advice, which is not necessarily taken.

Employee Services Branch has to undertake a process of redefining the primary role of the HR function away from processing transactions to more of a strategic advisory role to hiring managers and increasing its compliance role. Hiring managers would therefore assume more responsibility and accountability for functions such as staffing and reclassifications.

The organization is currently looking at implementing a process for delegation of authority for staffing actions. Inasmuch as there is a need to complete the delegation of authority, there will be a greater need to ensure that formal or mandatory training is implemented to ensure that hiring managers possess the required information in order to effectively and efficiently deal with human resources activities while ensuring transparency and fairness.

3 STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF 2007 AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

2007 Recommendation 1

That Employee Services enhance its management framework and practices by developing an integrated planning framework which would define an overall HR strategy for the HR function and from which would emanate a true HR plan linked to business priorities as well as implement control mechanisms to ensure that policies, procedures and guidelines are respected by hiring managers.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Employee Services is developing a Talent Management Strategy, which addresses departmental needs, succession planning, recruitment, retention, and employee development. The strategy is being developed in consultation with client

departments and will provide the framework for an integrated business approach to address current and future HR needs of the City of Ottawa. The strategy will be presented to the Executive Management Committee (EMC) in Q1 2008. In addition, Employee Services will start reporting staffing anomalies to department heads, including non-compliance along with recommended courses of action, by the end of Q2 2008.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 1 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of the first part of this recommendation is 60% complete. The Human Resource Plan has gone from a branch plan to a corporate plan and was completed in draft form in October 2008. It has been vetted internally by Employee Services. The final plan is not yet complete as it will need to be aligned to the new corporate structure currently undergoing reorganization.

Implementation of the second part of this recommendation is 90% complete. Employee Services has started reporting staffing anomalies to Directors and General Managers, including non-compliance along with recommended courses of action on an ongoing basis as they arise. A summary report is delayed due to the organizational realignment and is expected to be complete in January 2009.

Management: % complete ***60%***

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 1

The City has developed a draft Human Resources Strategic Plan 2009-2011 called "Delivering Service Excellence through People". The first section of the plan provides a macro level environmental scan of the talent management challenges facing employers at large as well as the City to attract and retain talent in the future. It reviews trends and pressures and provides a snapshot of the City's employee profile. However, the work completed to date does not sufficiently identify the anticipated gaps, priorities and strategies necessary to achieve the strategic business priorities and challenges of the City and, more importantly does not cascade these into departmental and branch action plans and initiatives with goals and expectations to drive efforts and results against stated objectives.

OAG: % complete ***60%***

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 1 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding.

The Human Resources Strategic Plan 2009-2011 was created in 2008 and will form the basis for the corporate-wide 'People Plan' that is currently under development. The objective of the initial plan was to create awareness and understanding of the talent issues facing the City. The next phase is to evolve the plan into strategic priorities, objectives, an action plan and measurable outcomes that are linked to

organizational objectives and workplans. This work has been initiated and will be completed by the end of 2010.

Management: % complete *60%*

2007 Recommendation 2

That Employee Services implement a framework in support of increased delegations, designed in such a way as to improve the efficiency of HR services while preserving its integrity through appropriate control mechanisms. In order to be able to staff positions, appropriate delegation of authority and training should be provided to hiring managers. Delegated authority should be removed from those hiring managers who do not adhere to staffing policies, guidelines or provisions outlined in the collective agreement.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Employee Services is in the process of reviewing and clarifying the role of the hiring manager and respective delegated authorities and accountabilities. Once the roles are clarified, a control framework will be implemented and training will be provided to hiring managers regarding staffing policies, guidelines and provisions contained in collective agreements. These actions will be completed by the end of Q2 2008. Control framework will include a reporting process to department heads by the end of Q2 2008 that addresses non-compliance along with recommended courses of action that may include the removal of delegated hiring authority.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 2 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 95% complete. An inventory of HR policies, guidelines and provisions within collective agreements is complete. In addition, policies, procedures and guidelines have all been reviewed. Final review of the delegation of authority for each procedure has also been completed. Further discussion is pending the final organizational realignment. Revised completion date is Q1 2009.

Management: % complete *95%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 2

The policy on Organizational Unit and Position Management-Delegated Authority provides managers with a clear definition of delegated authority for the approval of changes to organizational units and positions within the City of Ottawa. Furthermore, a complete repertoire of policies and reference material is available to managers on the City's Ozone Intranet site.

OAG: % complete *95%*

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 2 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding.

The staffing control framework and supporting documents will be finalized and posted by the end of Q2 2010.

Management: % complete 95%

2007 Recommendation 3

That Employee Services focus on reporting in an integrated fashion on high level projects, strategies and plans with targets and risks in order to establish performance indicators for key priorities for the HR function.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Employee Services provides volumetric information to management including EMC, and has started to provide more in-depth analysis on key indicators, such as excess vacation leave and uncertified sick leave. Employee Services also provides detailed reporting and analysis at the department and branch level for several measures, such as Workers Safety Insurance Board (WSIB) and Employee Assistance Program (EAP). Employee Services participates in various benchmarking initiatives, such as the Ontario Municipal Benchmarking Initiative (OMBI), and the Human Resource Benchmarking Network (HRBN). These surveys provide pertinent comparators, and future scorecards will be updated, based on management requirements, to provide more relevant measures with comparisons to benchmarked performance. Performance reporting on high-level Human Resource projects, strategies and plans will be provided to EMC on a quarterly basis.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 3 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete 100%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 3

As stated in the original audit of staffing, the City does provide a significant amount of data to EMC, but does not report in an integrated fashion on strategic human resources targets, goals or risks. The "scorecard" is a repository of volumetric information and is a good tool to track and report on volumes, but it has very little performance measure of goals, risks and results against the key strategic talent management challenges and objectives facing the City.

OAG: % complete 50%

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 3 as of Winter 2010

Management disagrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that implementation of this recommendation is only partially complete.

HR developed and released a new comprehensive Talent Scorecard in mid 2009. The Scorecard is issued to all department heads, and in some cases branch heads, on a quarterly basis. The Scorecard provides quantitative information related to recruitment, diversity representation, retirement eligibility, attrition rates, extended leaves, etc. Human Resource Consultants review the Scorecard with departments/branches on a quarterly basis to determine if there are risks associated with the level of attrition, upcoming retirements, level of diversity representation, level of staffing for departmental priorities, etc.

Management considers implementation of this recommendation to be complete.

Management: % complete **100%**

2007 Recommendation 4

That Employee Services establish a better monitoring and controlling process to reinforce the requirement to follow expected procedures and establish clear accountability. This would include having a mechanism to escalate the reporting of anomalies, discrepancies or blatant disregard for the staffing policy in order for EMC to be made aware of those situations and to ensure that action is taken.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Employee Services currently escalates staffing anomalies to senior management prior to processing the final staffing action. Employee Services will start reporting staffing anomalies to department heads including non-compliance along with recommended courses of action, by the end of Q2 2008.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 4 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 4

Monitoring continues to be done through day-to-day activity and the current method of resolving a difference of opinion between HR and the hiring manager is often to escalate to the next level of management for a decision. Documentation of these anomalies is apparently done by emails. However, during the course of the follow-up audit no evidence was provided to establish that staffing anomalies are reported and that senior management is made aware of the risks involved as a

result of hiring managers and others not following human resources advice and not adhering to established staffing policies and guidelines.

OAG: % complete ***50%***

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 4 as of Winter 2010

Management disagrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that implementation of this recommendation is only partially complete.

Anomalies are dealt with at the time that they arise and most are resolved without escalation. If escalation is required, it is done through conversations with the respective senior managers. A tracking sheet has been set up to track any escalations on a go-forward basis should it be necessary.

Management considers implementation of this recommendation to be complete.

Management: % complete ***100%***

2007 Recommendation 5

That Employee Services develop and implement staffing directives and guidelines to govern staffing activities for MPE and SAS vacancies.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Employee Services will develop and implement staffing directives and guidelines to govern staffing activities for Management Professional Exempt (MPE) and Supervisory and Administrative Support SAS vacancies by the end of Q2 2008.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 5 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete ***100%***

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 5

Employee Services has developed minimal provisions to guide staffing activities to fill vacancies within the Management Professional Exempt (MPE) group and as well as for the Supervisory and Administrative Support (SAS) group by references contained within the respective Terms and Conditions of Employment for each group.

OAG: % complete ***100%***

2007 Recommendation 6

That Employee Services review the policy “definitions” to include a broader definition of “family”. Once the policy is modified, ensure appropriate communication strategy to clearly explain to all hiring managers and employees the importance of being free from any real or perceived improper influence based on familial relationships in order to maintain public confidence in the integrity of the City’s hiring and employment practices. Family members in existing direct reporting relationships should be reassigned.

2007 Management Response

Management disagrees with this recommendation.

The City’s Hiring and Employment of Family Members Policy was passed by Council in September 2003 so as to be in compliance with a statutory requirement for municipalities to enact a Hiring Policy.

Considerable debate occurred surrounding the issue of defining which family relatives should be addressed in the policy. To a large degree, the discussion centered on whether siblings should be included; however, a motion to include siblings was defeated on a vote by Council. Part of the concern expressed was that a broader definition of "family" may run afoul of the provincial or federal Human Rights Codes as well as the Charter of Rights and Freedoms.

In the end, Council adopted the same language to define "family" as is used in two pieces of provincial legislation, the Municipal Conflict of Interest Act and the Police Services Act. This definition includes parents, spouse and children, only, and is sufficient to satisfy the statutory requirement on Council.

Although the definition of “immediate family” is limited to parents, spouse and children, the City’s Policy does provide a sufficient amount of flexibility within which any individual employee or member of Council could self-disclose based on their own, broader interpretation of family.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 6 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation has not yet begun. This item was discussed at the November 21, 2008 meeting of CAWG and will go to Council for approval in the next quarterly report. CAWG has directed the City Manager to review the definition of “family member” contained in the portion of the Hiring Policy that relates to employees, with a view to establishing a broader definition of “family member” that is in keeping with the spirit and intent of the policy and the law in this regard, and to report such direction to Council. The Auditor General was in agreement with the abovementioned direction.

Management: % complete

0%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 6

There has been no further development to review on this issue at this time.

OAG: % complete *0%*

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 6 as of Winter 2010

Management disagrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that there has been little or no action taken to implement this recommendation.

A revised Code of Conduct has recently been distributed to SMC for review and comment. Once the Code is finalized, the Hiring and Employment of Family Members policy will be updated to reflect any changes related to the definition of "family member". Once updated, an appropriate communication strategy will be developed for management and employees.

Management considers implementation of this recommendation to be partially complete.

Management: % complete *50%*

2007 Recommendation 7

That Employee Services implement controls in order to ensure that only applicants who clearly meet the minimum requirements outlined on job posters are interviewed. Screening reports should be signed by the responsible manager who is accountable for the screening, attesting that the candidates proposed for interviews meet the minimal education and experience and that the final screening report should be sent to Employee Services for review prior to inviting candidates for interviews or testing.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation, however believes the policy should allow for exceptions.

Employee Services already screens the candidates based upon posted qualifications. Candidates who meet the minimum qualifications are recommended to the hiring manager for an interview. The HR consultant reviews the screening reports jointly with the hiring manager and consensus must be reached before the interviews are conducted. Hiring managers are asked to sign off on the final selection of candidates and provide rationale for candidates who were not initially screened-in by Employee Services. Where consensus cannot be reached, the matter is escalated to a higher level of management and will be included in the report of staffing anomalies that is brought to the director of the branch. The practice of escalating screening issues where consensus could not be reached started in 2007.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 7 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete 100%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 7

While in theory the process outlined in management's response appears adequate to provide the necessary checks and balances to prevent potential opportunities for people who know someone (family members or others) to be screened in without meeting the basic requirements, the reality is that the controls currently in place are not sufficiently rigorous to prevent this from happening. The fact is that none of the competition files reviewed contained any equivalency rationale decisions nor was there any evidence provided to support the fact that where consensus cannot be reached matters are escalated to a higher level of management and included in a report of staffing anomalies.

The issue of screening in candidates who do not meet the minimum requirements for a position was the of previous audits including a Fraud and Waste Hotline complaint referred to in the May 2009 Report to the Office of the Auditor General. Furthermore, in a sample of eight competitions reviewed for compliance, one competition for a supervisory & administrative support position screened in candidates screened out by Employee Services and did not interview all candidates screened in by Employee Services but a selective few. In either case no rationale was provided to support these decisions.

Such practices undermine the credibility of the staffing process. If the City chooses to allow exceptions to meeting the minimum requirements of a position it should only do so in very exceptional circumstances and that a more rigorous approval process be implemented and documented on file to protect the integrity of the staffing process and to ensure that the City receives fair value from incumbents from a job evaluation and salary standpoint.

OAG: % complete 50%

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 7 as of Winter 2010

Management disagrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that implementation of this recommendation is only partially complete.

The Human Resources department conducts initial screening of candidates against the posted requirements and the City's equivalency guidelines. Where the application of an equivalency may be appropriate and Human Resources is unable to readily make this determination (particularly for jobs with technical requirements), the practice is to have the hiring manager involved with making this assessment. In these instances, employees who are deemed to have equivalent

education and experience are considered to have met the minimum requirements of the position and as such, would be screened in for an interview. Hiring managers continue to be required to sign off on the final selection of candidates and provide rationale to demonstrate how candidates meet requirements where they were not initially screened in by Human Resources.

Protocols for documenting rationale on a consistent basis have been initiated on a go-forward basis.

Management considers implementation of this recommendation to be complete.

Management: % complete

100%

2007 Recommendation 8

That senior management retain search firms only after City processes do not generate qualified candidates and that, in those cases, allocation of work be balanced as per the recommendation outlined in the 2005 Audit of Procurement.

2007 Management Response

Management disagrees with this recommendation.

It has been the practice of the City since amalgamation to use executive search firms to undertake recruitment of senior management positions. The executive search firms have access to a nationwide talent pool that is not available to the City, which ensures the City casts the widest net possible to attract top talent to these key senior positions and serves to validate that the best possible candidate is selected.

Executive search firms are pre-qualified based on their experience in recruiting senior executives. The selection of the executive search firm to conduct the search is based on the firm that has the most relevant experience recruiting for the position that needs to be filled.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 8 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete. This item was discussed at the November 21, 2008 meeting of CAWG and will go to Council for approval in the next quarterly report. The Auditor General and CAWG agreed that Employee Services and the client department will assess the current market specific to the position being recruited for and will conduct a preliminary assessment of internal resources using each branch's succession plans which are part of the City's overall talent management strategy. The City will only use executive search firms to recruit for senior management positions and positions requiring specialized skills where this assessment warrants it. When competing the standing offer in the fall of 2008, greater emphasis will be put on the financial component of the evaluation and consideration will be given to pre-qualifying fewer firms. Additionally, the call-up procedure for each executive search will include seeking proposals from all of the

pre-qualified firms with the selection based on best value considering both professional services offered and cost.

Management: % complete ***100%***

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 8

Only informal assessments of current market specifics and of internal resources are conducted before proceeding with executive search firms. None of these assessments are documented on the recruitment files as suggested in management's response.

The City conducted a request for Standing Offer to provide professional Executive Search/Specialized services and as a result the City currently has four pre-qualified firms on the standing offer. The call-up procedure for each executive search does not seek, as stated in the management response, proposals from each pre-qualified firms but only from those who are deemed to have particular expertise in a certain profession. The justification to use external executive search firms as well as the reasons for choosing some firms over others should be documented on the staffing file.

OAG: % complete ***75%***

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 8 as of Winter 2010

Management disagrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that implementation of this recommendation is only substantially complete.

In the last standing offer process conducted in January 2009, executive search firms were asked to provide information about the experience of their firm and successful search assignments; including three detailed examples of search assignments. They were also asked to provide information with respect to sourcing a diverse candidate pool, including bilingual candidates, and to provide the experience of each of the key team members that would be assigned to the City of Ottawa searches. Through review of the technical proposals of each of the selected firms, management has the detailed information required to make the appropriate selection in choosing executive search firms.

Under the standing offer arrangement management may choose the firm that is best suited to their recruitment needs. The HR professionals working with managers run through a number of scenarios that take into consideration an assessment of the market and internal resources to determine if the services of a search firm are required. The outcome of this decision is reflected in the actions taken in the staffing file. In future, the considerations will also be noted.

Management considers implementation of this recommendation to be complete.

Management: % complete ***100%***

2007 Recommendation 9

That hiring managers provide appropriate documentation for selection processes at senior management levels and ensure that Employee Services are involved in these selection processes.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Currently, Employee Services works closely with the executive recruitment firm and the hiring manager throughout the recruitment process. This participation includes involvement at the short-list meetings and on the hiring board. Documentation of these hiring processes is now consistent with the City standards for competition files.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 9 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete *100%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 9

Based on a review of executive recruitment files there is sufficient documentation to support that Employee Services is closely involved with the hiring manager and the executive recruitment firm throughout the recruitment process.

OAG: % complete *100%*

2007 Recommendation 10

That hiring managers methodically complete screening reports and board reports to document their actions and decisions. Interviews should not be initiated until the hiring manager has provided a written rationale on the screening summary report to the Human Resource Consultant as to who will be interviewed and letters of offer should not be provided until the board report is completed.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Employee Services developed a number of key tools and on-line resources in 2006/2007 to guide hiring managers through the interview process and assist in recording hiring decisions. A Consensus Scoring and Selection Decision Summary and revised Interview Guide are sent to the hiring manager, along with the screening summary and detailed information with respect to the hiring process. Starting in 2007, letters of offer were not provided to the hiring manager until the Consensus Scoring and Selection Decision Summary was completed by the hiring manager and sent to Employee Services.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 10 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete 100%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 10

Based on a review of 12 recruitment and competition files, there have been considerable improvements made to the quality and quantity of documentation found on files with few exceptions. The tools provided by Employee Services are being used and documentation such as the Screening Summary and the Consensus Scoring and Selection Decision Summary are completed by the hiring manager before letters of offer are provided

OAG: % complete 100%

2007 Recommendation 11

That Employee Services and hiring managers sign off the screening report on education and experience (unless seniority is the driving factor) to ensure that all considered candidates possess the minimal requirements. Those candidates who do not clearly articulate how they meet the requirements should be "screened out". Human Resources must take a greater role in ensuring candidates meet the minimal education and experience.

2007 Management Response

See Recommendation 7.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 11 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete 100%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 11

As stated earlier under recommendation 7, candidates continue to be screened in without meeting the minimum requirements of the position sought and the controls currently in place are not sufficiently rigorous to prevent this from happening. The fact is that none of the competition files reviewed contained any equivalency rationale decision nor was there any evidence provided to support the fact that where consensus cannot be reached matters are escalated to a higher level of management and included in a report of staffing anomalies. Furthermore, management permits the use of exceptions.

By appointing personnel who do not meet the requirements of the positions, the organization risks having an unqualified workforce which can ultimately have an impact on program delivery.

The job requirements directly affect the level of compensation of the position. If the person in the position does not meet the job requirements, they are being over-paid. Similarly, if the position does not need the requirements, then the position is over-classified.

OAG: % complete

50%

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 11 as of Winter 2010

Management disagrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that implementation of this recommendation is only partially complete.

The Human Resources department conducts screening of candidates against the posted requirements and the City's equivalency guidelines. Where the application of an equivalency may be appropriate and Human Resources is unable to readily make this determination (particularly for jobs with technical requirements), the practice is to have the hiring manager involved with making this assessment. In these instances, employees who are deemed to have equivalent education and experience are considered to have met the minimum requirements of the position and as such, would be screened in for an interview. While, the rationale for application of equivalencies has not always been documented in the screening summary, it will be documented on a go-forward basis. Hiring managers continue to be required to sign off on the final selection of candidates and provide rationale for candidates who were not initially screened in by Human Resources.

Management considers implementation of this recommendation to be complete.

Management: % complete

100%

2007 Recommendation 12

That Employee Services implement controls to ensure that only candidates possessing the required accreditations be interviewed and that equivalencies not be used in those instances.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Employee Services already has controls in place to ensure that only candidates who have the required accreditations (e.g. registered nurse, professional engineers) are considered for the position. Equivalencies are not considered for positions that require accreditation.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 12 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete

100%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 12

The two competitions reviewed involving accreditations did confirm that only those who possessed the required accreditations were considered for the positions.

OAG: % complete **100 %**

2007 Recommendation 13

That Employee Services and senior management reiterate the concept of equivalency and its purposes and that screening be done accordingly in order to ensure that successful candidates meet the basic requirements of the positions.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Equivalencies will form part of the training offered to hiring managers on the staffing process in Q3 2008.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 13 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 13

Hiring Managers receive regular training, advice and reminders from Employee Services on the staffing and selection policies, procedures and guides where the concepts of equivalency and screening are dealt with in great details. Furthermore, key aspects of hiring are part of the core curriculum for "Growing Leaders" and emphasize the key elements of the City's policy. The City also provides a complete repertoire of staffing and selection tools, which are available to Managers on Ozone. Nevertheless as stated in recommendations 7 and 11, there is a need for a more rigorous control to ensure that successful candidates meet the basic requirements of the position before being considered.

OAG: % complete **100%**

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 13 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that this recommendation is complete. However, as stated in the management responses to Recommendations 7 and 11, management believes that the controls in place are sufficiently rigorous to ensure that candidates meet the basic requirements of the position before being considered.

Management: % complete **100%**

2007 Recommendation 14

That hiring managers refrain from making verbal offers and ensure that a sufficient timeline be allowed for the competition files to be reviewed and for letters of offer to be done prior to the start date of successful candidates.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Employee Services will remind hiring managers of this requirement at the start of each job competition.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 14 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete *100%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 14

Based on a review of 12 recruitment and competition files, there was no evidence of verbal offers and in all cases Employee Services was advised prior to letters of offers being made. In fact Employee Services sends an e-mail in most cases reviewed, at the start of the competition or recruitment, indicating all the documents that need to be returned to them before a letter of offer can be provided.

OAG: % complete *100%*

2007 Recommendation 15

That Employee Services discontinue its practice of screening candidates who fail to appropriately fill out the electronic application as the onus should remain on the applicant.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

The use of electronic application tools for some may still be relatively new, and there may be a requirement for Employee Services to address the technical functionality of the tool. Employee Services will move toward implementation of this recommendation by Q3 2008.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 15 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete *100%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 15

In the case of electronic applications Employee Services ensures that only those who meet the requirements of the position are screened in

OAG: % complete **100%**

2007 Recommendation 16

That Employee Services consider automating certain processes and tracking mechanisms to provide both the hiring manager and Employee Services with on-line status at any time.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

In Q1 2008, Employee Services will work with Information Technology Services to determine the possibility of automating the tracking mechanism that would provide the hiring manager and Employee Services on-line staffing status in real time. Costs will be determined at that time and if significant will be requested in the 2009 budget.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 16 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 95% complete. IT is currently working on modifications to provide hiring managers with access to on-line staffing status. Roll out is expected in Q1 2009.

Management: % complete **95%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 16

Access to on-line staffing status is still not available to managers due to delays related to IT priorities. The framework and tools are in place and it is expected to go live within the next few months.

OAG: % complete **95%**

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 16 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding.

Management has determined that although implementation of a solution to provide access to managers to their on-line staffing status was close to implementation, it will be further delayed. Subject to technological and process changes, the solution originally proposed is now being reviewed to ensure that new technology is optimized. This review will be completed in Q2 2010 in conjunction with the replacement of the current applicant tracking system.

Management: % complete **95%**

2007 Recommendation 17

That Employee Services design and implement a mechanism for candidates to sign as part of the acceptance process, which would systematically require confirmation that they have maintained “a no demerits record”.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Employee Services has amended the letter of offer to include a sign off by candidates, which will validate that they have maintained a no demerits driving record.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 17 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete *100%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 17

Ten letters of offer reviewed for Bus Operators show that the letters have been modified to validate and confirm in writing that the successful candidates have maintained a no demerits record.

OAG: % complete *100%*

2007 Recommendation 18

That Employee Services undertake to fully document the process, the steps and the methodology used to retain the knowledge and continue to improve on process. This documentation could also incorporate the various models of letters, forms, templates, as well as an index of the existing electronic files for future reference.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Employee Services will document the bus operator recruitment process by the end of Q2 2008.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 18 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete *100%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 18

A comprehensive document entitled “Bus Operator Recruitment Guidelines” has been prepared and implemented which outlines in great details the recruitment

process, the requisite requirements and documentation as well as provides sample letters, memos, etc.

OAG: % complete *100%*

2007 Recommendation 19

That Employee Services ensure that DCM approval is obtained and documented on file and that hiring managers develop clear rationale and justification for effective dates prior to sending to Employee Services. Those who do not provide sufficient information or have weak rationales should not be processed.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

Employee Services implemented this recommendation in Q4 2007 and has worked with hiring managers to ensure strong rationales are provided and documented for requested effective dates.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 19 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete *100%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 19

For the period of July 2008 to August 2009 there were ten requests approved for classifications with retroactivity beyond six months. All supporting documents were received in job evaluation. Of the ten approved seven were approved by the DCM, two by a GM, and one by an Executive Director. We could not confirm the significance if any of not having the approval of the DCM for three of the re-classifications. The reason may likely be related to changes in titles and/or delegation of authorities.

OAG: % complete *100%*

2007 Recommendation 20

That Employee Services, along with the hiring managers perform an assessment of employees in reclassified positions in order to ensure that the incumbents continue to meet the requirements of these positions.

2007 Management Response

Management agrees with this recommendation.

As of Q1 2008, hiring managers will be required to assess existing employees to ensure they meet the requirements of their positions, where their positions have

been reclassified to a higher level. This will be addressed with the hiring manager at the time the request for reclassification is submitted.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 20 at December 31, 2008

Implementation of this recommendation is 100% complete.

Management: % complete *100%*

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 20

For the period of September 2008 to July 2009 there were 16 reclassifications approved which resulted in higher minimum requirements for education and experience for the incumbents of these positions. Of the 11 positions that were incumbered at the time of the reclassifications all 11 incumbents were deemed to possess the new and enhanced qualifications for their position. It is somewhat unusual that all incumbents met the new enhanced requirements. It does raise some concern as to the whether the reclassifications were based on real needs of the position or simply to accommodate incumbents.

OAG: % complete *100%*

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 20 as of Winter 2010

Management agrees with the OAG's follow-up audit finding that implementation of this recommendation is complete. However, management is concerned with the conclusion in the OAG's follow-up audit finding that it is somewhat unusual that all 11 incumbents met the new enhanced requirements. There is an insinuation that the reclassifications were done simply to accommodate the incumbents. There appears to be no factual basis for such a conclusion.

Management: % complete *100%*

4 SUMMARY OF THE LEVEL OF COMPLETION

The table below outlines our assessment of the level of completion of each recommendation as of Fall 2009.

CATEGORY	% COMPLETE	RECOMMENDATIONS	NUMBER OF RECOMMENDATIONS	PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL RECOMMENDATIONS
LITTLE OR NO ACTION	0 – 24	6	1	5%
ACTION INITIATED	25 – 49	-	-	-
PARTIALLY COMPLETE	50 – 74	1, 3, 4, 7, 11	5	25%
SUBSTANTIALLY COMPLETE	75 – 99	2, 8, 16	3	15%
COMPLETE	100	5, 9, 10, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17, 18, 19, 20	11	55%
TOTAL			20	100%

5 CONCLUSION

The results of the follow-up audit indicate that the Employee Services Division (now Human Resources Department) has done a considerable amount of work in developing and integrating an impressive repertoire of staffing, recruitment and competition tools to support hiring managers and to ensure that the proper processes and documentation are used to substantiate staffing decisions.

However, one area of continued concern is that candidates are still being considered without meeting the minimum requirements of the position, and the controls currently in place are not sufficiently rigorous to prevent this from happening. The fact is that none of the competition files reviewed contained any equivalency rationale decision, nor was there any evidence provided to support the fact that where consensus cannot be reached, matters are escalated to a higher level of management and included in a report of staffing anomalies. Furthermore, management permits the use of exceptions.

By appointing personnel who do not meet the requirements of the positions, the organization risks having an unqualified workforce which can ultimately have an impact on program delivery.

While Employee Services Branch has taken a service and advisory role to hiring managers as “clients” with more authority delegated to them, it has not in turn sufficiently focused on its monitoring and oversight roles. There are no consequences to hiring managers who have adopted practices that are not within the spirit of the City of Ottawa’s policies.

The other area that needs to be further expanded into executables and measurables is the Human Resources Strategic Plan 2009-2011 called “Delivering Service Excellence through People”. The first section of the plan provides a macro level environmental scan of the talent management challenges facing employers at large as well as the City to attract and retain talent in the future. It reviews trends and pressures and provides a snapshot of the City’s employee profile. However, it now needs to move from a promise to a reality. It must address many more questions: How do you move past planning and into execution? What process, talent or technology investments will be necessary? What changes may be required in collective agreements? How can stakeholders work together to chart a course of action, execute on it and measure the results? The work completed to date does not sufficiently identify the anticipated gaps, priorities and strategies necessary to achieve the strategic business priorities and challenges of the City and, more importantly does not cascade these into departmental and branch action plans and initiatives with goals and expectations to drive efforts and results against stated objectives.

Management Comment

Management disagrees with some of the statements made in the follow-up audit report's Conclusion section as indicated below.

Auditor:one area of continued concern is that candidates are still being considered without meeting the minimum requirements of the position...

Management: The Human Resources department conducts initial screening of candidates against the posted requirements and the application of the City's equivalency guidelines, as required. On occasion, particularly for jobs with technical requirements and where the application of an equivalency is required, the hiring manager is involved in making this assessment. In these instances, candidates who are deemed to have equivalent education and experience are considered to have met the minimum requirements of the position and as such, would be screened in for an interview.

While it is agreed that the rationale for application of equivalencies has not been consistently documented in the screening summary in the past, it will be documented on a go-forward basis. This finding on its own is not sufficient evidence to conclude that candidates do not meet requirements. Hiring managers continue to be required to sign off on the final selection of candidates and provide rationale for candidates who were not initially screened in by Human Resources.

Auditor: There are no consequences to hiring managers who have adopted practices that are not within the spirit of the City of Ottawa's policies.

Management: The findings of the follow-up audit indicate that there is a need to improve the documentation or record where staffing decisions have been challenged or escalated by HR. Management agrees that documentation of these instances can be improved upon and steps have been taken to do this. However, the follow-up audit did not uncover evidence that managers are adopting practices that are inconsistent with City staffing policies. There are consequences to managers who do not follow City of Ottawa policies. The Code of Conduct states that "Upon receiving written disclosure of an actual or potential breach of the Code, the Department Head shall either determine that no breach exists or take reasonable steps to ensure that the matter is addressed in the appropriate manner".

With regard to the Human Resources Strategic Plan 2009-2011 created in 2008, management agrees that the next phase is to develop a plan with executable and measurable actions that are linked to organizational objectives and workplans. This work has been initiated and will be completed by the end of 2010. The objective of the initial Plan was to create awareness and understanding of the talent issues facing the City.

6 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We wish to express appreciation to the staff and management for their cooperation and assistance throughout the audit process.